

# Haut conseil de l'évaluation de la recherche et de l'enseignement supérieur

European and International Department

# Qatar University – Bachelor of Law

# Evaluation and accreditation documents

- 1/ Evaluation Report (12 pages)
- 2/ Accreditation Decision (4 pages)



Haut conseil de l'évaluation de la recherche et de l'enseignement supérieur

European and International Department

Qatar University – Bachelor of Law

**Evaluation Report** 

2016

# **HCERES**

#### Haut conseil de l'évaluation de la recherche et de l'enseignement supérieur

European and International Department

For the HCERES,<sup>1</sup>

Michel Cosnard, president

On behalf of the expert committee<sup>2</sup>

Philippe Didier, president of the committee

In accordance with the decree n°2014-1365, November 14th, 2014,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The president of HCERES "contresigne les rapports d'évaluation établis par les comités d'experts et signés par leur président." (Article 8, alinéa 5) — "countersigns the assessment reports made by the experts' committees and signed by their president" (article 8, alinea 5)

<sup>2</sup> The evaluation reports "sont signés par le président du comité". (Article 11, alinéa 2) — "are signed by the president of the committee" (article 11, alinea 2).

### Report of the chairman of the expert committee after the assessment of the evaluation document and the on-site visit of a Training Programme

University/institution: Qatar University

Component, faculty or department concerned: College of Law

Programme's title: Bachelor of Law

Training/speciality: Law

Specialist sector or sub-speciality:

#### Site(s) where the programme is taught:

Institution(s): Qatar University, College of Law

Town(s): Doha, Qatar

#### Speciality manager:

First and last names: Dr. Mohammed Al-Khulaifi

Profession and grade: Dean and Assistant Professor of Law

Main subject taught: Commercial Law

Tel.: (+974) 4403 5296

Email: m.a.alkhulaifi@qu.edu.qa

#### Committee' Members:

- Prof. Philippe DIDIER, Professor of Law, Université Paris Descartes;
- Prof. Patricia PARTYKA, Professor of Law, Université d'Avignon et des pays de Vaucluse;
- Prof. Jean-Jacques ANSAULT, Professor of Law, Université de Rouen;
- M. Maxime TOUCHAIS, Ph.D Student, Université Paris Descartes.

#### **HCERES Scientific Advisor:**

Prof. Martin LEBEAU

### Training programme presentation

The Bachelor of Law programme (LL.B) offered by the College of Law of Qatar University is a degree aimed at giving a general legal education. That education is mainly in Qatari Law (both private and public, both domestic and international) but the programme offers the opportunity to have a strong introduction to Common Law.

It is a full time programme for students with no prior legal training. After completion, students are able to master the knowledge and skills expected from a professional lawyer and are able to practice as such.

Graduate students are expected to be able to work as lawyers directly after graduation and as a matter of fact alumni hold legal positions.

It was created in 2006 and currently a little more than 1300 students are enrolled in the programme.

The bachelor degree may also be a first step for students wishing to receive a higher legal education through a Master of Law degree as those offered by the College.

### On-site visit description

#### Summary of the proceedings:

The on-site visit took place on the campus of the Qatar University located on the northern border of Doha. The campus covers about 8 square kilometers and houses all colleges.

The College of Law is currently housed by the College of Business and Economics. Some meetings were also held in a building shared by several colleges. A new building, specifically devoted to the College of Law, is planned and should be operational by 2019. Once complete, it will house all operations of the College of Law.

The committee also visited the Campus Library and the University Administration building.

Current and future facilities are duplicated in order to offer separate spaces for male and female students. Segregation applies only to students. Faculty members teach indifferently in the male and female section. In the same way, offices of the Faculty members are located indifferently in the male and female section of the buildings.

All visited buildings are quite recent and offer a quiet and pleasant environment amounting to efficient working conditions.

The visit took place from April 2<sup>rd</sup> to April 4<sup>th</sup>.

#### Organization of the visit:

The schedule of the visit was proposed to the committee on the eve of its arrival on the campus. It was based on the requests made by the committee and sent in advance to the College of Law. Some additions had been made to broaden the scope of the meetings.

#### Cooperation of the training programme and of the Institution:

The College of Law of the Qatar University sent its self assessment report prior to the visit, according to the agreed schedule.

The Committee would like to thank all the Faculty and Staffers of the College and the University for their cooperation and frankness during its visit. It would specially like to extend its grateful thanks to Dr Abdessalam Lachaal for his dedication and availability during the visit.

During the whole process, no request from the committee has been denied. During its stay in Qatar, the committee was denied access to no place, no document or person, even if schedule did not allow the committee to spend as much time as it would have liked with some persons (see below).

The committee is confident that the conclusion it has reached is based on a fair and full disclosure of all relevant information.

#### Persons met:

During its visit on site, the committee met the following people:

- Academics and students from the University:
  - Dr. Yaser El-Khalaileh, Dean for academic affairs and acting Dean while the Dean is performing his military duties;
  - Dr. Francis Botchway, Associate Dean for research;
  - Dr. Yassin El-Shazily, Associate Dean of Outreach and Engagement;
  - Ms. Ola Shadid Teaching Assistant/Assistant Dean for Student Affairs;
  - Dr.Islam Sheeha, Assistant Professor of Law, who acted as the representative for Dr. Mohamed Mattar, Clinical Professor of Law, who was attending a conference in South Africa during the visit;
  - Dr Conrad Sturm, Clinical Assistant Professor of Law;
  - Dr. Melissa Deehring Montouché, Lecturer and Student Advisor;
  - Ms. Sara Elzubai, Educational Technology Specialist;
  - Representative for the International Review of Law;
  - Members of the Faculty;
  - Male and female students.
- Staffers from the University:
  - Dr. Mazen Al Hasna, Vice president of academic affairs;
  - Dr Imad Bachir, Director of Library;
  - Dr Arslan Ayari, Director of the Office of Faculty and Instructional Development (OFID);
  - M. Abdel Hakim Bishawi, MLS, senior Information Literacy Librarian.
- Partners from outside the University:

The committee had also the opportunity to meet with graduates and employers in an informal way, during the Annual Alumni Day held at the University, including M. Firas Ahmed, Head of International Cooperation Bureau, Office of the Attorney General of Qatar.

During its stay in Qatar, the committee was also received by the *Premier Secrétaire de l'Ambassade de France*, the Ambassador being out of the country.

#### Possible problems:

The committee reports no major hindrances to its work.

HCERES has scheduled a three days visit. Accordingly, the Committee' members had freed three full days over their own weekend to be available for the visit. However, the schedule of the visit was finally based on two days since the first day of the stay of the committee was a weekend day and the University was closed.

The Committee regrets that mishap. It did not prevent the Committee from performing its mission in a significant way. However, it did lead to a tight schedule and some meetings had to be cut short in a frustrating way for both parties attending.

### Synthesis of the assessment

#### Global appreciation:

#### 1. Educational project

The Bachelor of Law programme (LL.B) aims at giving a general education in the field of Law to enable students to hold any position in the legal sector.

More specifically, the programme pursues three goals.

First, the programme aims at giving graduate students a good theoretical knowledge and understanding of legal concepts and legal reasoning. Students are taught to think as lawyers.

Second, the programme aims at giving graduate students a good knowledge of the Laws applicable in Qatar. As a result, students learn Qatari Laws and institutions. This education is done in Arabic and is the bedrock of the programme. Through that part of the programme, students learn the Civil law tradition which is at the foundation of the Qatari Law and is shared by other countries in the region and beyond. However, a distinctive feature of the programme is that it also aims at exposing student to Common Law thinking. Qatar is an international hub of finance and trade, part of which is done according to Common law. Therefore, beside their bedrock education in the Civil law tradition, students are giving the opportunity to receive an introduction to Common Law. This programme is taught in English.

Third, the programme aims at giving students a professional training in the field of law. That professional training is comprehensive, meaning that it covers both court related skills (filing a petition before a court, arguing a case...) and out of court skills (drafting memo and contracts, legal advice...).

The programme offers students the opportunity to acquire knowledge and skills that prepare them to hold any position in the legal field.

The bachelor degree may also be a first step for students wishing to receive a higher legal education through a Master of Law degree. The Master of Law degree of Qatar University is not part of the current accreditation process and will not be discussed. Suffice it to say that the Bachelor of Law degree offers a legal education that gives the requisites necessary to join a Master of Law degree.

To graduate, students must complete a total of 123 Credit Hours. Those credit hours are divided into:

- Compulsory law courses (46% of total). They cover all the foundational topics of a legal education. They are taught in Arabic.
- Compulsory clinical courses (7% of total). They are taught in English and improve professional skills.

- Elective law courses (20% of total). Students are offered a choice among courses that cover various topics including advanced professional skills. Elective courses are taught either in Arabic or in English depending on the topic.
- Compulsory non-law courses (27% of total). Half of them are language classes (Arabic and English); half of them are general interest topics (social sciences, science and regional history).

In practice, the curriculum allows students to receive either a bilingual legal education or a strictly Arabic legal education (except for the compulsory clinical teachings).

Each class is taught twice a year to allow students to choose the term during which they wish to attend that class. In theory, students are free to choose which class to attend first. However, in practice, most classes have prerequisites, which means that the order of classes is mostly preset, ensuring a harmonious learning curve.

Grades are set by instructors based on variety of exercises and dispersion of grades is monitored by the College. Faculty members are required to follow the College of Law Grading Policy.

No specific programme exist to send students abroad.

#### 2. Place occupied in the scientific and socioeconomic environment

The College of Law is part of the Qatar University which is the only state-sponsored University in Qatar. It was established in 2006 as a spinoff of the College of Sharia and Islamic studies. Since then, it has maintained separate faculty, programmes and buildings even if students are offered the opportunity to attend some classes of the College of Sharia.

The Faculty is composed of 9 professors, 12 associate professors and 24 assistant professors. These numbers include the clinical Faculty which is composed of 1 clinical professor and 5 clinical assistant professors.

To the permanent Faculty must be added 3 lecturers, 16 teaching assistants and 10 visiting Faculty.

The Faculty is rapidly expanding. It doubled in the past 3 years.

Faculty members come from both Arab Universities of high renown and major western universities. Both civil tradition and Common Law tradition are present.

The College of Law is the only institution offering a legal education programme in the country. In the region, other Bachelor of law programmes exist in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia or in the United Arab Emirates. However, of course, none of them offers a legal education in Qatari Law.

#### 3. Students: admission to the training programme

Recruitment is achieved through different channels. On one hand, Qatar University proposes open days in high schools, and on an other, the College of Law offers courses and workshops for the benefit of professionals to allow them to integrate consequently the programme.

The enrolment takes place in fall and spring semester, for every academic year. It follows a formalized process. The Admission Department of Qatar University sets the admission requirement for each college, namely a minimum high school grade and specific criteria for each programme. So the recruitment is selective. It is appropriate to underline that these criteria are clearly defined and communicated to the applicants.

Currently, 1374 full time students are enrolled in the College of Law. They are distributed as follows: 84% Qatari and 16% foreign, 38% male and 62% female (at the University's level, 25% male and 75% female). The number of students increased in 2012. In fall 2011 there were 298 students and in fall 2012, 724. Since then, the number of students has been regularly growing: 830 students in fall 2013, 1028 in fall 2014, and 1114 in fall 2015. From the interviews, the committee understands that the admission requirement has changed to become less demanding. Today, the minimum required level is based on the achievement of 75% of the high school grade, permitting a larger access to the studies. The College of Law can thereby answer to the expanded employment offer of the socio-economic world. But, in the same time, it proposes honours programmes to

distinguish the best students. The College of Law can thus answer to a dual purpose and reconciles mass education and promotion of elites.

Qatar University offers services to facilitate students' mobility: accommodation for students, visas for outgoing Qatari students, and helpful tips or advice for orientation in University. Concerning foreign students, in the perspective of international development of QU, it could be useful to guarantee them a visa for the whole studies.

#### 4. Integration of graduates into the job market and continuation of chosen studies

The number of undergraduate students was 38 in 2010-2011, 58 in 2011-2012, 90 in 2013-2014 and 106 in 2014-2015. It is in accordance with the growth of registered students.

Students need about 4 years to graduate, which is standards-compliant for a LL. B.

The pass rate has increased, from 73% in 2012 to 86% in 2015 while the failure rate has decreased from 14% to 5% in the same years as well as the drop-out rate which passed from 13% to 9%. However, the progression rate has tumbled, from 80% in 2012 to less than 40% afterwards. The rate of at-risk students has grown from 7% in 2011 to 23% in 2015. That can be explained by the larger recruitment and consequently by students' lower level at the beginning.

Until recently, the College of Law did not propose any offer to pursue a higher education. There was no Master programme in Qatar. 6 students have gone abroad, in USA, 3 of them to do a Master of Law and 3 others a PhD. This has changed in 2015 when the College of Law has opened two Masters of law, one in public law and one in private law.

The rate of integration to the job market is satisfactory confirming that the training gives the knowledge and skills required to meet the needs of the labour market. The rate increased from 49% in 2010 to 91% in 2013. The Law's externship programme offers traineeship in different institutions or fields such as Ministry/Government, International Law Firms, Qatari Law Firms, Judicial, Social Welfare, and even in the Qatar University. It contributes probably a lot to promote the good professional insertion. But there is no detail given about the type of jobs acceded. It could be interesting to develop a meaningful data about careers followed by QU graduates, and especially to check the difference between male and female graduates as to their professional integration.

As to the links with the Community, students are offered the opportunity to participate to events, most of the time organized by the College of Law and in connection with law.

The learning outcomes, defined as legal knowledge, critical thinking skills, research skills, ethics and professional responsibility, communication skills, self-reliance and collaboration, are the subjects of examination. The results seem overall satisfactory. According to these results, different improvements have been introduced, such as "improving student motivation". This point seems to be also a request of the academic staff.

#### 5. Programme management

The College of Law is headed by a Dean, appointed by the University leadership among the Faculty members. He is assisted by 4 associate Deans, in charge of specific topics (academic affairs, research and graduate studies, student affairs, outreach and engagement).

The Dean is in charge of running the college. Several College committees exist to assist him, each one covering a specific field (academic affairs, hiring and promotion, student affairs...). Added to them there is a College Advisory Board which is composed of distinguished members of the legal community. It helps the College understand the needs of the legal professions and of the Society. It also helps nurture a strong relationship with them.

The College of Law has a strong culture of monitoring, assessing and evaluating all aspects of its activities.

The College has developed several policies to regulate and improve the content of the courses and how it is conveyed to the students. They must be strictly followed.

In addition, the self-evaluation system includes an annual satisfaction survey carried out by the

Qatar University Statistics and Survey Office.

Faculty members are mandatorily trained in the use of IT tools and are encouraged to use them. The Office of Faculty and Instructional Development give support and assistance to Faculty members to improve their teaching skills and methods.

Faculty members are assessed by students at the end of each course. They are also assessed by the Dean at the end of each academic year. The annual evaluation is based on the achievements in terms of teaching, scholarship and service. For the preparation of the annual evaluation, a comprehensive and detailed record of all activities (be it teaching or research) must be maintained by each faculty member.

Faculty Members have access to several incentive schemes both for teaching and research achievements. Besides the College boasts to be the highest paying institution in the legal field in the Region.

The College of Law has submitted itself to an outside evaluation twice in the past. A first evaluation was conducted by the American Bar Association in 2008 and a second evaluation was conducted by a non-affiliated team in 2011. As a result of these assessments, several substantial changes were made to the Programme. In particular, the clinical courses that exist in the current form of the programme are a direct result of those past evaluations.

#### Strengths:

• The College of Law is strongly committed to achieving excellence in its bachelor programme.

The evolution of the College shows that in a few years, it has made new and bold strategic moves to adapt itself to the needs of its students. The curriculum has been altered and expanded to align itself with the best law programmes.

The commitment of the College is backed by adequate means. The College benefits from the investments made by University in inter-college programmes (such as OFID) or facilities (such as the library). But it also benefits from specific investment such as the hiring of new faculty or the construction of a new building.

That commitment is guided by the best use of external expertise. The College is open to outside advice and has taken into account recommendations made to it. Along the same line, the College has a strong culture of self-assessment and of implementing improvements.

• The Bachelor programme has been designed by taking into account the peculiarities of the Qatari situation.

Qatar, like other countries in the region, has a legal system rooted in the Civil Law tradition. Its judiciary and its laws are characterized by a specific mix of Islamic principles and French legal thinking, which is the hallmark of the Arabic Civil Law tradition. But at the same time Qatar is a hub of international trade and finance. Qatari authorities and companies are exposed to dealing with partners from all over the world, some of which may be more familiar with Common Law.

The Bachelor of Law programme has been designed to prepare students to deal with that duality. The legal education students received is anchored in the Civil Law tradition, as it should be dealt with the legal history and tradition of Qatar, but at the same time, students are offered the opportunity to be familiar with the Common Law tradition.

• The Faculty is highly dedicated to achieving the goals of the College. It comes from a diverse background which ensures that students are exposed to different thinking and different ways of dealing with legal issues. Faculty members are graduated from major universities. They maintained a strong commitment in their personal research and are encouraged to do so by the College.

Currently, most Faculty members are foreigners hired for a limited period of time and who are on leave from their respective universities. After completion of their contract in the College of Law,

they will go back to their respective universities. That situation puts Faculty Members in an awkward position. The position they hold in the College of Law requires that their teaching and research be focused on Qatari Law and Qatari perspectives. But at the same time, since they know that the rest of their career will be in their native countries, they must stay active and prominent in their native Law. As long as their position at QU will not be stable, it would be more rational for Faculty members to focus on home issues and topics. Instability of position at QU is a direct disincentive that hinders the development of a truly Qatar-focused legal thinking.

• The College nurtures strong links with the legal profession and the Community at large. The College is connected to leaders in the legal fields and has been listening to suggestions from them.

The College of Law has developed an expert role for the benefit of the Qatari leadership. It has repeatedly organized workshops and seminars about proposed new laws. Those events are formative for students who are made aware of current major legal issues. They are important for the College because they help maintain tight links with the public authorities and the private sector. They are important for the building of the Nation because they help Qatar design its laws in accordance with its own specific blend of Arabic Civil tradition and Common Law, thus preserving its identity and traditions.

#### Weaknesses:

• The committee was surprised by the possibility of appealing against a grade. If it is laudable to give students who have been unfairly graded the possibility to get a remedy, it would be also damaging for the College to expose instructors to undue pressure from bad faith students. From the discussion it had, the committee understood that the appeal process is a two-tier system, with an appeal first at the College level then at the University level. It understood that it is rarely used. It also understood that some discussions about grades have been settled outside the formal process.

It is of the utmost importance that instructors retain the practical ability to decide if the grade is based solely on the assessment of the students' work. The independence and freedom of instructors in the grading process is paramount to its reliability and to the institution's reputation. Any doubt may jeopardize it.

• As a result of previous external assessments, the College has developed bold clinical and practical programmes. Those programmes fulfill an important task by providing students with professional skills

It should be kept in mind that the professional education of students is an integral part of any legal education, whether in the Civil Law tradition or in the Common Law tradition. It would be simplistic to think that by nature one system is more theoretical or more practical than the other. To work efficiently, both in Civil Law or Common Law, students must learn to master the same tools: they must master analytical thinking as well as synthetic thinking. They must be able to understand the peculiarities of particular situations and put them in the context of the whole system as well as to see the individual and practical stakes of an abstract statement.

The clinical teachings must prepare students of the College of Law to their actual professional life. Since the majority of them stay in Qatar and practice Qatari Law within the Qatari public sector and Qatari Judiciary, the option to compare clinical teachings with Common Law training may be a matter for debate.

• The College of Law has developed a set of policies covering all the aspects of the work of the Faculty Members. In particular, the content of the teachings is governed by what appears as strict rules (such as the choice of the textbook by the College). The positive aspect of this policy is that it ensures that all students receive exactly the same education no matter the term or the section of the course.

However, it should also be kept in mind that the purpose of any legal education is to learn how to think. Students must learn the framework of a legal mind. But they must also learn to think "outside the box". It is their adaptability that will make them valuable on the job market. During their teaching, instructors of any level must have some leeway to help students develop their own

thinking and hone it. They must have some flexibility to adapt to the group they have in front of them and find the best way to convey the knowledge, skills and creativity that will make them true lawyers. In the same way, students must be made aware that the Law is not just about preset recipes. They must learn to think autonomously.

### Recommendations to the university

- The number of students has grown exponentially, partly as an answer to the increasing needs of the Country. In that context, the College has changed its enrolment requirements. The College should take care to maintain a high standard of enrolment to be able to maintain its high standard of education.
- The clinical and practical teachings should not be limited to US and Common Law. It should include Qatari Law and practice.
- As far as the content of the classes is concerned, the framework set by the College should maintain sufficient freedom for instructors to adapt to the peculiarities of the students they have in front of them.
- The stability of Faculty members should be a central concern for the long term policy of the College.
- The College should develop a tool to track systematically the professional career of alumni, including gender-based idiosyncrasies.
- The College should consider helping foreign students get a visa of sufficient duration to allow them to complete the programme.
- Specific comment: in line with Qatari law and traditions, the College of Law gives a separate education for male and female students. The College should strive to maintain a fair and equal treatment for both groups of students. In particular, since female students are twice as numerous as male students, the efforts and means of the College should be allocated accordingly. In the same way, the pledge of the College to improve the number of female Faculty members has been duly noted and will be a matter of scrutiny.

# Comments of the University

The University has no specific comment and accepts the recommendations mentioned in the report.

# **HCERES**

Haut conseil de l'évaluation de la recherche et de l'enseignement supérieur

Europe and International Department

Qatar University – Bachelor of Law

**Accreditation Decision** 

# SCOPE OF THE ACCREDITATION GRANTED BY HCERES

HCERES has built its evaluation process based on a set of objectives that higher education institution study programmes must pursue to ensure recognised quality within France and Europe. These objectives are divided up into four fields among which are the accreditation criteria. The accreditation committee, meeting his accreditation decision, has wholly taken into account the final evaluation report of the study programme. This accreditation decision is the result of a collegial and reasoned process.

The accreditation decision issued by HCERES shall not grant any rights whatsoever, whether in France or abroad. The decision on training programme accreditation confers an accreditation label and does not infer recognition of the accredited qualifications. The HCERES accreditation process therefore has no impact on the qualifications recognition process in France.

# FULFILLMENT OF ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

# Field 1: Aims of the study programme

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA**

The objectives of the study programme with regard to knowledge and skills to be acquired are clearly defined and communicated. Students and other stakeholders are aware of outcomes in terms of job opportunities and further studies.

#### ASSESSMENT OF CRITERIA

According to the experts committee, the objectives of the Bachelor of Law program (LL.B) are clear. They have identified three of them:

- giving graduate students a good theoretical knowledge and understanding of legal concepts and legal reasoning. Students are taught to think as lawyers;
- giving graduate students a good knowledge of the Laws applicable in Qatar. As a result, students learn
  Qatari Laws and institutions. And in the meantime, the programme also aims at exposing students to
  Common Law thinking. The College of Law is the only institution offering a legal education program in
  the country. In the region, other Bachelor of Law programs exist in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia or in the
  United Arab Emirates. However, of course, none of them offers a legal education in Qatari Law;
- giving students a professional training in the field of law. The program offers students the opportunity to
  acquire knowledge and skills that prepare them to hold any position in the legal field. The learning
  outcomes were identified by the expert committee as "legal knowledge, critical thinking skills, research
  skills, ethics and professional responsibility, communication skills, self-reliance and collaboration".

The evaluation report gives information about further studies, job market opportunities and their completion rates, but does not provide any information on the awareness of students and stakeholders.

## Field 2: Position of the study programme

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA**

The study programme has set a comprehensive positioning suited to its objectives and including a clear link with research, scholarly partnerships and/or with the economic and social world, national and/or international partnerships.

#### ASSESSMENT OF CRITERIA

"A strong commitment to achieve excellence" might sum up the position of the study programme, as explained by the expert committee. They have noticed that the programme "has made new and bold strategic moves to adapt itself to the needs of its students. The curriculum has been altered and expanded to align itself with the best law programs".

The Bachelor program has been designed by taking into account the peculiarities of the Qatari situation.

The College nurtures strong links with the legal profession and the Community at large. The College is connected to leaders in the legal fields and has been listening to suggestions from them.

The College of Law has developed an expert role for the benefit of the Qatari leadership. It has repeatedly organized workshops and seminars about proposed new laws. Those events are formative for students who are made aware of current major legal issues. They are important for the College because they help maintain tight links with the public authorities and the private sector. They are important for the building of the Nation because they help Qatar design its laws in accordance with its own specific blend of Arabic Civil tradition and Common Law, thus preserving its identity and traditions.

As a result of previous external assessments, the College has developed bold clinical and practical programs.

It should be kept in mind that the professional education of students is an integral part of any legal education.

The clinical teachings must prepare students of the College of Law to their actual professional life. Since the majority of them stay in Qatar and practice Qatari Law within the Qatari public sector and Qatari Judiciary, the option to compare clinical teachings with Common Law training may be a matter for debate.

## Field 3: Study programme teaching structure

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA**

The study programme includes a set of teaching units that are coherent, gradual and adapted to all kind of students. The study programme allows students to acquire additional skills that are useful for employment or further study.

Internships and projects are included in the study programme curriculum. So are Information and Communication Technologies in Education (ICTE) and education innovations. The study programme prepares students for the international environment.

#### ASSESSMENT OF CRITERIA

The experts were able to identify a set of teaching units (divided into 123 Credit Hours). The repartition of these credit hours (Compulsory law courses = 46% of total; Compulsory clinical courses = 7% of total; Elective law courses = 20% of total; Compulsory non-law courses = 27% of total) looks coherent and gradual.

With programs taught half in Arabic and English, on the one hand, and courses of general interest topics on the other hand, students have the opportunity to develop additional skills.

It is true that learning foreign languages and studying in other languages than the native one is a way to

prepare students for the international environment. But no specific program exists to send students abroad.

The Law's externship program offers traineeship in different institutions or fields such as Ministry/Government, International Law Firms, Qatari Law Firms, Judicial, Social Welfare, and even in the Qatar University. It contributes probably to promote the good professional insertion. But there is no information about the trades or vocations practised by the former students.

As to the links with the Community, students are offered the opportunity to participate to events, most of the time organized by the College of Law and in connection with law.

# Field 4: Study programme management

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA**

The study programme is implemented by a formally identified and operational teaching team including stakeholder and student participation. It is carried out by an educational team which benefits from clear and up-to-date data. Methods for checking knowledge are explicitly stated and communicated to students. Teaching and practical professional units are expressed in terms of skills.

Anti-fraud measures have been implemented.

#### ASSESSMENT OF CRITERIA

The composition of the Faculty was formally identified within the evaluation report. Stakeholder participation is included whereas student participation is not yet implemented.

The governance of The College of Law is also highlighted in the report.

Recruitment criteria were selective even if they are becoming less demanding; these criteria are defined and communicated to the applicants. The content of teachings and their regulation are governed by strict rules which has a double side effect:

- methods and contents are explicit;
- · there is few flexibility.

# FINAL ASSESSMENT

Considering the accreditation criteria detailed above, the accreditation committee issues the following decision:

"Five-year unreserved accreditation decision"

#### **SIGNATURE**

For HCERES and on behalf of

Michel COSNARD,

President

Date: Paris, June 8<sup>th</sup>, 2016