



International evaluation and accreditation

## EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION DOCUMENTS

### Masters of Law (Public and Private Law)

College of Law

Qatar University

Qatar

**March 2023**

Rapport publié le 04/04/2023

## CONTENTS

Evaluation report	pages	1 to 17
Comments of the institution	page	18
Accreditation decision	pages	19 to 24



International evaluation and accreditation

## **EVALUATION REPORT**

### **Masters of Law (Public and Private Law)**

College of Law

Qatar University

Qatar

**December 2022**

Qatar University has mandated the Hcéres to perform the evaluation of both masters of law programs in Public & Private Law. The evaluation is based on the “External Evaluation Standards” of foreign study programs, adopted by the Hcéres Board on October 4<sup>th</sup>, 2016.

On account of exceptional circumstances, the organization of the evaluation was adapted (replacement of the physical onsite visit by the panel by a visit by videoconference), while remaining compliant with the fundamental principles of institution or study program evaluation: external evaluation standard applied, the self-evaluation report (SER) and requested annexes sent by the institution, panel of experts set up by Hcéres, collegial work by the panel, interviews with the institution and its partners by videoconference, report drafted and then sent to the institution in its provisional and then final version, response by the institution to the report by the panel. This specific procedure is in line with the official position defined jointly by EQAR and ENQA.<sup>1</sup>

On behalf of the experts committee<sup>2</sup> :

Johanna Guillaumé, President of the committee

For the Hcéres<sup>1</sup> :

Thierry Coulhon, President

In accordance with the decree n°2021-1536, November 29<sup>th</sup>, 2021,

<sup>1</sup> The evaluation reports "sont signés par le Président du comité". (Article 13) — “are signed by the President of the committee” (article 13).

<sup>2</sup> The President of Hcéres "contresigne les rapports d'évaluation établis par les comités d'experts" (Article 8, alinéa 8) — “countersigns the assessment reports made by the experts' committees” (article 8, alinea 8).

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://enqa.eu/index.php/home/enqa-statement-on-covid-19-pandemic/>

## CONTENTS

I. STUDY PROGRAMS IDENTITY SHEET .....	4
II. ON-LINE VISIT DESCRIPTION .....	7
Composition of the experts panel .....	7
On-line visit description .....	7
III. PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS .....	8
1 – Presentation of the study programs .....	8
2 - Presentation of the programs self-evaluation approach .....	9
IV. EVALUATION REPORT .....	9
1- AIMS OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS .....	9
2 – POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS .....	10
3 – STUDY PROGRAMS TEACHING STRUCTURE .....	12
4 – PROGRAMS MANAGEMENT .....	13
V. CONCLUSION – Master of Private Law .....	14
VI. CONCLUSION – Master of Public Law .....	16
VII. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION .....	14

## I. STUDY PROGRAMS IDENTITY SHEET

### University/institution:

Qatar University

### Component, faculty or department concerned:

College of Law

### Programs' title :

- Master of Public Law
- Master of Private Law

### Year of creation and context:

Qatar University was established in 1977. It was the first national institution of higher education in the country.

An appointed Board of Regents and the University President govern Qatar University.

Qatar University hosts ten Colleges: College of Arts and Sciences (CAS), College of Business and Economics (CBE), College of Education (CED), College of Engineering (CENG), College of Health Sciences (CHS), College of Law (LAWC), College of Medicine (CMED), College of Pharmacy (CPH), College of Sharia and Islamic Studies (CSIS) and College of Dental Medicine (CDM).

Qatar University offers 48 Bachelors, 32 Masters, 9 Ph.D. programs, 4 Diplomas, and a Doctorate of Pharmacy (PharmD).

Legal studies began in 1993. At that time, the Department of Legal Education was a part of the College of Sharia and Islamic Studies. In 2006, The College of Law became a separate entity.

The College of Law is committed to providing its students legal education. It offers a Bachelor's Degree of Law (LLB). Since 2015, it also offers two Master's degrees in Private Law and in Public Law.

### Site(s) where the programs are taught (Town and campus):

Qatar University chose to locate in the North of the capital Doha. Qatar University has one campus with two sides, one for male students and one for female students.

Given the health context, the visit to the campus was virtual. The facilities offered to students are very satisfactory: library, computer center, book store, medical clinic, mosque, cafeteria, sports facilities, food services, transportation, etc.

The whole campus is modern and offers students an ideal environment.

## PROGRAMS' DIRECTOR:

- Surname, first name: Dr Muna Al-Marzouqi
- Profession and grade: Dean of the College of Law, Assistant Professor
- Main subject taught: Maritime and Commercial Law.

## METHODS AND RESULTS OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION(S)

### Methodology and agency

In 2016, only the Bachelor of Law was submitted to the Hcéres evaluation. Consequently, it was accredited for five years without conditions. In the same year, the College of Law was accredited for four years by the British Accreditation Council (BAC).

In 2016, the Hcéres made several recommendations that can be helpful to understand the overall context and the conditions in which the Master's programs were created:

- "The number of students has grown exponentially, partly as an answer to the increasing needs of the Country. In that context, the College has changed its enrolment requirements. The College should take care to maintain a high standard of enrolment to be able to maintain its high standard of education.
- The clinical and practical teachings should not be limited to US and Common Law. It should include Qatari Law and practice.
- As far as the content of the classes is concerned, the framework set by the College should maintain sufficient freedom for instructors to adapt to the peculiarities of the students they have in front of them.
- The stability of Faculty members should be a central concern for the long-term policy of the College.
- The College should develop a tool to track systematically the professional career of *Alumni*, including gender-based idiosyncrasies.
- The College should consider helping foreign students get a visa of sufficient duration to allow them to complete the program.
- Specific comment: in line with Qatari law and traditions, the College of Law gives a separate education for male and female students. The College should strive to maintain a fair and equal treatment for both groups of students. In particular, since female students are twice as numerous as male students, the efforts and means of the College should be allocated accordingly. In the same way, the pledge of the College to improve the number of female Faculty members has been duly noted and will be a matter of scrutiny".

## HUMAN AND MATERIAL RESOURCES DEDICATED TO THE PROGRAMS

### Human resources

#### Teaching staff:

The College of Law relies on 42 full-time faculty members. They can be professor (13), associate professor (10) or assistant professor (19).

The College also relies on 4 Clinical faculty members : 2 Clinical professors of law and 3 Clinical assistant professors of law.

The majority of the faculty members have a Phd and the majority of faculty members are male.

The College also relies on lecturers and professors assistants.

Table 1 – Distribution of the faculty members according to gender

	Professors		Associate Professors		Assistant Professors	
Gender	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
	11	2	9	1	16	3

Table 2 – Distribution of the PhD holders among the faculty members

	Professors	Associate Professors	Assistant Professors	Total
Total	13	10	19	42
Phd	13	10	13	36

Table 3 – Distribution of the faculty members according to their position and specialities

	Professors		Associate Professors		Assistant Professors	
	Public	Private	Public	Private	Public	Private
Public Law or Private Law	5	8	3	7	5	14

The Faculty is large and of high quality. It has a variety of profiles in terms of legal specialities.

The Faculty is also diverse in terms of nationality or country where the academics graduated. This diversity allows for a rich teaching, particularly from the point of view of comparative law.

The administrative staff for the College of Law consists of 18 people.

### STUDENT POPULATION: EVOLUTION AND TYPOLOGY OVER THE LAST 4 YEARS

Table 4 - Number of students enrolled in 2022

Master of Private Law	Master of Public Law
41 students	77 students

Table 5 - Evolution of newly registered Masters' programs students

	<b>Total</b>	<b>Male</b>	<b>Female</b>	<b>Qataris</b>
<b>Fall 2017</b>	44	23	21	37
<b>Fall 2018</b>	38	15	23	33
<b>Fall 2019</b>	30	12	18	23
<b>Fall 2020</b>	37	14	23	27

## II. ON-LINE VISIT DESCRIPTION

### COMPOSITION OF THE EXPERTS PANEL

- Johanna Guillaumé, Full Professor of Law, University of Rouen Normandy, Dean of the College of Law, Chair of the panel;
- Mathieu Cardon, Associate Professor of Law and Lawyer, University Jean Moulin Lyon 3;
- Guilhem Julia, Associate Professor of Law, Sorbonne University Paris Nord.
- Zakia Mestari, Phd student in Law, Toulouse Capitole University.

The Hcéres was represented by Michelle Houppé, Head of project in the Europe and International Department.

### ON-LINE VISIT DESCRIPTION

- Date of the visit:

The visit took place from Sunday March 6<sup>th</sup> to Monday March 7<sup>th</sup>, 2022. Given the health context, the visit was held virtually through online meetings organised by Qatar University.

- Summary of the proceedings:

Before the visit was conducted, the self-assessment report had been received by the experts. A proposed planning for the visit was discussed and approved by the experts.

The e-visit went ahead according to the planning.

Meetings and visits were scheduled morning and afternoon for both days.

- Organization of the visit:

#### **Sunday March 6<sup>th</sup> 2022:**

- Opening session: Dean of the College of Law, Dr. Muna Al-Marzouqi
- Presentation of the programs and discussion: Dean of College (Dr. Muna Al-Marzouqi), Associate Dean for Research and Graduate (Dr. Nisrin Mahasneh), Assistant Dean for Student Affairs (Dr. Aisha Al Ammari,), Head of the Legal Skills Department (Dr. Mohamed Mattar), Head of the Private Law Department (Dr. Imad Kattan), Head of the Public Law Department (Dr. Ahmed Hassanein).
- Virtual tour on the Campus.
- *Alumni* and Employers from Bachelor and Masters.

### Monday March 7<sup>th</sup> 2022:

- Presentation and discussion about the Master of Public Law.
- Presentation and discussion about the Master of Private Law.
- Students from both Masters.
- Teaching staff from both Masters: Dr. Ayad Haroon, Dr. Abdelnasser Hayajneh, Dr. Islam Chiha, Dr. Mohamed Salem, Dr. Ahmed Almuhtadi.
- Quality assurance: Head of the International Relations and Quality Assurance Committee (Dr. Mohamed Mattar), Dr Andrew Dahdal, Dr. Rafael Brown, Dr. Faisal AlAhbabi.
- Closing session for the programs: Dean of College (Dr. Muna Al-Marzouqi), Associate Dean for Research and Graduate (Dr. Nisrin Mahasneh), Assistant Dean for Student Affairs (Dr. Aisha Al Ammari,), Head of the Legal Skills Department (Dr. Mohamed Mattar), Head of the Private Law Department (Dr. Imad Kattan), Head of the Public Law Department (Dr. Ahmed Hassanein).

#### – Cooperation of study program and institution to be accredited:

The College of Law of Qatar University has been cooperative throughout the process.

The self-evaluation report was sent in advance, according to the agreed schedule. It was supplemented by documents in the appendix.

The Committee is absolutely satisfied that the conclusion reached is based on fair and full disclosure of all relevant information.

## III. PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS

### 1 - PRESENTATION OF THE PROGRAMS' SELF-EVALUATION APPROACH

A self-evaluation report has been drawn up for each of the master's courses, but both reports include many similarities, like the SWOT analysis for example, which points at identical strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats. Although the study plans of the two masters are different in their content, the structure, functioning and objectives of the two masters are identical. According to the panel of experts, this shows the coherence of the College of Law in the construction of the training offer at master level.

The self-evaluation reports are supplemented by annexes, which are not always easily accessible.

Moreover, the report on the bachelor's degree is sometimes very similar to the reports about the master's degrees, and there is a lot of copying and pasting of text. It was therefore sometimes difficult to identify the specificities of each program. In this respect, the on-line visits and the discussions with various stakeholders were quite helpful.

### 2 – PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS

Admission to both master's programs is selective. The applicant must hold a Bachelor of Law degree from Qatar University or any other accredited university in the State of Qatar. In addition, the applicant must have obtained his or her bachelor's degree with an average of at least 2.8 out of 4 (GPA). He/she must also provide supporting documents, such as a letter of motivation and letters of recommendation. Then successful candidates have a personal selection interview before enrolling in the program.

Both masters target a population of students who are already integrated in the job market but look for a deeper legal expertise and higher qualification. Continuing their studies at master level allows them to consider a promotion in their job or a better professional perspective. In order to allow employed students to study, the schedule is adapted and courses take place in the evening.

Both master's degrees are a two-year program. The study plan consists of compulsory courses, optional courses and a master thesis. Both programs also rely on a comprehensive and qualified Faculty and administrative support staff at the level of the College of Law.

Both masters have points in common in their general aims: provide a high level of understanding of the fundamentals of the law; enabling students to acquire a rigorous legal method; developing critical thinking, enable students to specialise in particular areas of law.

Nevertheless, each of the masters also has its own specificity in terms of content. Indeed, the speciality courses are not the same in the two programs and the employment sectors concerned are not the same neither. It should be remembered here that in Qatar, the public and para-public sectors are the two largest employment sectors. Private sector employment exists but to a lesser extent. This may explain why the number of students enrolled in the master's program in private law is lower than in the master's program in public law, as shown in Table 4.

**In conclusion, the commonalities between the two programs are far more numerous than the differences and justify the option of a single report overarching the two master's programs. Therefore, the panel of experts decided to draft a single evaluation report common to both master's programs, but focused in the conclusion on specific points for each master.**

## IV. EVALUATION REPORT

### 1- AIMS OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS

The masters of Public and Private Law of Qatar University are two-year study programs that aim to prepare students to academic research or specialization in view of entering or accessing further opportunities (eg. promotion) in the labour market. Each master provides theoretical and practical courses that are taught in Arabic and in English. They are available to students who have already graduated from the Bachelor of Law of Qatar University or in any other accredited university in the state of Qatar since the program aims to improve the legal knowledge acquired at the bachelor level, both from the point of view of the content of the courses and the form of the evaluation.

Both masters are very competitive (about 200 applications per year are submitted) and cannot accommodate all applicants. 77 students are currently enrolled in the master of Public Law and 41 students in the master of Private Law, which can be explained by the particularity of the job market in Qatar where most students work in public agencies or administrations. Qatar University has several partnerships with public agencies or administrations, as for instance the Ministry of Administrative development, labour and social affairs. At the beginning of each semester, students are informed of the course syllabi presenting the content of the modules and the different learning outcomes: knowledge, legal thinking, scholarly research, communication (oral and written forms), ethics and professionalism, self-management and cooperation with colleagues. All these outcomes are valuable on the Qatari job market.

Both masters aim at two goals, both known by students.

- First, a research focus since students are encouraged to pursue a PhD (launched at Qatar University in 2020). Nevertheless, students are not formally divided into a research track and a professional track. All students have to write a master thesis (70-150 pages) as the last exam of the program that is equivalent to 6 credit hours. The thesis are supervised by at least one Faculty member and allow students to produce a first academic essay. Topics are related to

recent news which allows students either to pursue a PhD or to enter/return to the job market with a deep knowledge of current private or public law. In the same way, the development of two types of skills – legal writing and analysis and defending a personal idea – can be put to good use both in doctoral studies and on the labour market.

- Second, both masters follow a professional purpose. The programs offer only evening classes (3 hours a day, 3 days a week) which allow students to work at the same time. Around 80% of students are currently working. These workers come to improve their skills. The master's specialization can help those accessing better job opportunities, or getting promoted. There is an emphasis on International Law which resonates with the very open job market in Qatar.

**To conclude on the aims of the study program, the goals of the training, both in terms of knowledge and skills to be acquired and in terms of opportunities, are well defined and known by the students. The two masters of Public and Private Law are very competitive, despite a stronger attractiveness for the Master of Public Law, corresponding to the particularities of the job market in Qatar. The skills developed during the training are in line with the labour market which most of the graduates are willing to return to.**

## 2 – POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMS

In general, learners enrol in a master's degree after one, two or three years of break, as they seek to enter into the working life as quickly as possible after graduating from their bachelor's degree. Therefore, since almost all students have a job at the same time as their training, the courses taught in Arabic are given three days a week, from 5 to 8 pm. Only students who have obtained a minimum average of 2.8/4 in their bachelor's degree, and after a selection interview, are admitted to the master's programs. There are about two hundred applications. The master of Public Law shows more students (77) than the master of Private Law (41). Probably due to the fact that students have a parallel professional activity, it is rare for them to obtain their master's degree in two years, but more often in three (60% of them) or four years, which seems to be the maximum limit.

There is no real competition in Qatar between such academic programs as there are very few law programs in the country. Moreover, Qatar University, not the College, appears to be ranked 2<sup>nd</sup> among universities in the Arab world according to the Times Higher Education ("THE") ranking. The two masters' degrees delivered by the College of Law are claimed to be unique, and to enjoy a good reputation, due to an alleged in-depth teaching allowing to acquire a profound legal knowledge. The main competing degrees should be specifically examined in the regional context of the Middle East and North Africa ("MENA"), notably in the United Arab Emirates and in Kuwait. The number of foreign students in the master's programs is lower than in the bachelor's program, only two or three students per year, mainly from Bahrain, Jordan, Kuwait, and Saudi Arabia.

A significant proportion of the Faculty members come either from other countries in the region or other parts of the world, or have received their academic training abroad. This important cultural richness is rendering the training offer appreciated and attractive. For the future, the College of Law is considering the creation of new master's degrees, notably in sports law, media law and business law.

Concerning research, of the five modules that make up each master's degree, one is entirely dedicated to the research component. All students are required to complete a thesis, which is the final assignment of their study plan, and is usually conducted during the last four months of the second year of their master's degree. The thesis counts for 6 credits out of the 33 credits of the entire study plan. The topics chosen, whether on domestic or international law issues, are eminently linked to the contemporary environment (e.g., "The Application of Interim Measures in the International Court of Justice in the Light of the Case of the State of Qatar against the State of the United Arab Emirates" in public law; "Integrity in Sports: International Standards and Comparative Models" in private law). The objective of the exercise is for the students to acquire the expected skills in terms of writing, analysing and demonstrating a true thesis; in other words, to prove themselves.

More generally, research is far from being ignored. At the level of the teaching team, Faculty members are encouraged to publish, particularly on topics related to Qatari legal issues. The College encourages the Faculty members to publish in journals notably indexed in Scopus. The University is providing financial incentives for qualified publications. It is worth mentioning a journal published by the University, *The International Review of Law (IRL)* which is a biannual, internationally peer-reviewed and open access law journal, first issued in 2012 under Qatar University College of Law and published by Qatar University Press (QU Press). The review is used by researchers at the College as a support for publications in Arabic, English, and French. It should also be noted that, despite the absence of a research laboratory in the strict sense, the College of Law has been offering a PhD degree in Law since September 2020. About ten students have since embarked on a doctorate (6 students in Public Law; 3/5 students in Private Law).

Considering the relationships with business, associations or other cultural/industrial partners, insofar as almost all students have already a parallel professional activity, the master's programs do not include an internship. But, either because of this parallel professional activity or through the institutional links offered by the College of Law, students are regularly put in contact with law firms, public administrations, government authorities and agencies, and private institutions. Then, the members of the College of Law and their students are particularly involved in public interest missions. Furthermore, almost all Faculty members are consultants for a government department or agency depending on their area of expertise. In addition, the College of Law seems to have links with international organizations (World Bank Group, International Monetary Fund...). Finally, *Alumni* are also regularly invited to speak at the College of Law, providing students with the viewpoint and experience of professionals. The master's degrees seem to offer students an important opening to the economic and legal dimensions of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC).

Insofar as the students are only part-time, since they have a professional activity at the same time, there is no real reason for the master's degrees to be oriented towards international exchange programs. Nevertheless, the University and/or the College of Law claim to have a number of partnership or cooperation memoranda of understanding with foreign academic institutions. As examples, the one concluded with the National University of Ireland, University College Cork, the goal of which is to develop academic exchanges, and cooperation in areas of common interest (20...), or another one concluded with the Boston University School of Law focused on the development of an educational training program on counter-terrorist financing (2018). Others are signed with international organizations like the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) in 2016. Partnerships with foreign universities are also based on the close relationship that individual professors may have with their university of training or origin (mainly from USA, Europe and MENA Region).

**To conclude, the master's degrees are open to learners who are almost always employed at the same time, so classes are held three days a week in the late afternoon. Qatar University appears to be the only university in Qatar to offer such training. The two master's degrees are claimed to be unique, and seem to enjoy a good reputation. The training is open to Qatari and foreign students, mainly from the MENA region. The teaching team is marked by its cultural richness, which is recognized and appreciated. Since almost all students already have a professional activity in parallel with their training, the question of links with different categories of professional partners does not really arise. For the same reason, master's programs are not really concerned by the links with foreign academic institutions, which nevertheless exist at the College level, mainly through partnership or cooperation memoranda of understanding with a few foreign academic institutions, and through the individual relationships of some members of the Faculty.**

### 3 – STUDY PROGRAMS TEACHING STRUCTURE

The general objectives of the two Masters' degrees are similar, but each one allows the student to specialize differently: either in Public Law or in Private Law. The difference in curriculum between the

two programs is clear, since the courses offered in each one correspond to this thematic distinction: graduates should acquire a high level of understanding of legal issues in their chosen speciality.

The master's degree - Private or Public - is a two-year program consisting of four semesters. During the two years, the student must complete a total of 33 credit hours corresponding to 6 required courses (18 credit hours) and 3 elective courses (9 credit hours), then meet the graduation requirements by writing a master's thesis (6 credit hours).

	Number of courses	Credits hours
Required courses	6	18
Elective courses	3	9
Master's thesis	1	6
Total	10	33

The semesters are well distributed, with each of the first three semesters corresponding to 9 credit hours. The fourth semester is entirely devoted to writing the master's thesis.

The level of requirement is important, since the student must justify a certain level to obtain the master's degree. Indeed, a student cannot register the master's thesis unless he has successfully completed at least 15 credit hours and he cannot apply to defend the master's thesis unless he fulfills all the requirements of the courses with a GPA of no less than 3.00 from 4.00.

In each master's program, the *curriculum* seems sufficiently rich to allow students to acquire precise and specialised knowledge. Professors are encouraged to use interactive teaching through, for example, case studies, and role-plays. During the visits, exchanges with the academics showed that they are concerned with developing the students' critical and analytical minds.

In addition to academic knowledge, the program also prepares students effectively for their future working life, thanks to teaching based on the practice of law. Indeed, in addition to the traditional courses, the program is complemented by legal laboratories and legal skills courses. The legal laboratories allow for the acquisition of practical skills such as analysis of legal provisions or court decisions, legal writing or problem solving. This practical aspect is further enhanced by the legal skills courses. They aim to teach the practice of law: how to read cases, how to analyse laws, how to distinguish between tangible and intangible facts, how to find the relevant legal authorities for legal problems, how to develop and express a legal analysis persuasively, logically and concisely (both orally and in writing), etc.

It should also be noted that the two masters' courses give a lot of attention to legal research, especially through the master thesis. Discussions with the teaching staff have shown that the faculty members who supervise these master's theses provide very good supervision of the students.

**To conclude, the masters' programs are adapted to this level of graduate study and the courses offered in each of the programs are aligned with the respective specialties of Public and Private Law. Moreover, both programs allow students to acquire the high-level academic knowledge and practical skills necessary for future working life. Beyond the curriculum, the quality of the masters' programs lies in the quality of the teaching staff, their availability and their commitment.**

#### 4 – PROGRAM'S MANAGEMENT

The masters of law programs rely on the three departments of the College of Law: the Public Law department, the Private Law department and the Legal Skills department, one-of-a-kind in Arab universities. There is not a specific management committee or council dedicated to the two masters of law. However, the management of the masters seems to be correctly covered thanks to the different committees at the College of Law level.

The Dean and the College council are in charge of the connection between the College level and the University Level.

Nevertheless, the management organization seems a bit complex because of the many committees. It is difficult to identify the committees whose functions are sometimes crossed. Moreover, there are many differences between the list of the committees mentioned in the self-evaluation report and the description given by the College of Law members during the visit. It is unfortunate that the Faculty does not seem to be well informed about the management organization. It seems that many teaching members are not concretely involved in the different committees.

The teaching staff includes some law practitioners and displays a remarkable richness regarding its multiple origins. The courses are provided by faculty members coming from different countries such as Qatar, Jordan, but also UK, USA, or Australia. The differences of cultures and formations are very beneficial to master's students because it stimulates their open-mindedness. For instance, in addition to Qatari law courses, Common law and French law courses are provided to students.

Knowledge assessment is possible thanks to communication tools and various kinds of exams. The Faculty provides different types of exercises, in accordance with the needs of the students. The communication of the courses objectives is provided thanks to the syllabi. Regarding the students assessment, a review process is implemented; it allows the students to take a look at their evaluation. The students can evaluate each course thanks to a precise and anonymized evaluation class form.

Concerning the communication between the students and the Faculty, the Blackboard tool offers many educational opportunities and was very effective during these last two years of pandemic. The College of Law reaction to COVID pandemic was very quick and effective. As a result, the teaching and the communication with students have not been stopped during the pandemic.

The syllabi forms have been recently amended to include new sections, especially regarding the role of the students in the training process. The ways of teaching differ from the Bachelor of law methods. The students are - more considered like "researchers" rather than "students". This is specifically visible concerning the type of exercises required. Thus, the educational methods developed take into account the fact that most of the Masters students are already workers.

Each year, courses files are submitted to the Graduate office in order to report about what happened during the semesters.

Concerning the graduates monitoring, it is ensured at the level of the University thanks to an "Alumni group task". This task relies mainly on the *Alumni* association whose members are invited to the Annual University congress. At that time, the graduate students share their professional experiences and opportunities with current students, specifically regarding the externship program. An improvement could consist in the implementation of a permanent graduates monitoring process.

The quality of the masters of law programs is evaluated by the Quality assurance committee on the basis of a self-assessment evaluation. Created in 2016, following the previous Hcéres accreditation, this committee has been recently modified to take into account the international standards of quality, especially standards regarding ethics and non-discrimination. This Committee takes place at the level of Qatar University but all the College of law committees are involved in the Masters of law quality evaluation.

**To conclude, the management of the two masters is handled by a complex but comprehensive committee organization. The Faculty is very involved in the content of the courses and very concerned about the students' interest. This staff should be more involved in the management process.**

**The diversity of the Faculty is very beneficial to the masters of law program. The quality of the masters of law programs is evaluated by the University Quality assurance committee in accordance with the international standards of quality and ethics.**

## V. CONCLUSION – MASTER OF PRIVATE LAW

### STRENGTHS:

- The master of Private Law study plan is comprehensive enough to allow students to acquire precise and specialised knowledge for future working life. Issues like mediation and arbitration laws, international construction contracts, conflict of laws in international contracts are of current interest.
- The master's program stimulates students' thinking and develops their critical faculties.
- There is a tangible difference in level between the bachelor's and master's degrees which is reflected in the way students are taught and assessed.
- A good supervision of the master's thesis is implemented, targeting at topical subjects, like settlements of labor disputes in Qatar, arbitration in sports disputes, or integrity in sports for example
- A large and high-quality academic staff is in place, relying on 15 specialized professors or associate professors and 14 assistant professors, the vast majority of whom are PhD holders.

### WEAKNESSES:

- No institutional structure or body dedicated to research.
- No institutional method of monitoring the master of Law graduates: there are no official statistics concerning the professional integration of graduates or their further studies.
- Complex management structure.

### RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE INSTITUTION

For these different reasons, the panel of experts makes the following recommendations:

- One of the aims of the master in Private Law is to prepare students and qualifying them to move to the higher educational stage, the PhD degree in Law.
- In the self-evaluation report of the master, four mains goals are listed. Among these four, two are related to research:
  - o “3- Develop legal research, and filling the gap in the field of specialized legal research, in line with the legislative and judicial development within the Qatari, regional and international community.
  - o 4- Prepare learners and qualifying them to move to the higher educational stage, the PhD degree in Law”.

To achieve these objectives, the Private Law master's program is characterised by an orientation towards research, with the compulsory writing of a master's thesis. Students are prepared for research work and the writing of the master's thesis is well supervised by a referent teacher. But this is not enough. The master's program must also have a strong research component based on research methods, the use of documentary resources, and the promotion of collective, local or international research. Currently, there is no structure or body dedicated to research. The research activities of the faculty members exist (publication in scientific journals, organisation of conferences, visiting professors, etc.) but the effectiveness of the research dimension could be improved by the creation of a structure dedicated to research.

- The management structure is complex and not all faculty members are familiar with it. In order to make steering effective, it would therefore be beneficial either to simplify the existing structure or to provide more information about the existing structure.

- There is very good communication within the College of Law between academics and learners. This facilitated communication and the availability of the faculty members allowed for a very good management of the health crisis. But there is no institutional monitoring of graduates, i.e. a structure that sets up a process to monitor graduates at specific times, in order to assess their professional integration within a predefined framework (nature of employment, level of employment, remuneration, etc.). A more institutionalized follow-up would make it possible to ensure a good adaptation of the curriculum to the needs of the job market. This work is usually done at the university level, but the results are not precise enough for law graduates.
- The master's degree in Private Law seems less attractive than the other one in Public Law, whereas this master's degree is quite relevant on the job market in the private sector (to find a job or to progress if the student is already in the workforce). In fact, the public sector remains the largest employer of university graduates, with private sector employment representing a significant but much smaller proportion than the public or para-public sector. Even if the private sector employs less than the other sector, it would probably be relevant to focus on the attractiveness of the master's degree in Private Law, relying for example on the *Alumni* association.

## VI. CONCLUSION – MASTER OF PUBLIC LAW

### STRENGTHS:

- The master of Public Law curriculum is comprehensive enough to allow students to acquire precise and specialised knowledge for future working life. Comparative legal systems, law of international organizations, or cybercrimes, for example, are interesting topics at this level of studies.
- The master's program stimulates students' thinking and develops their critical faculties, by exposing students to real cases decided by Qatari courts for example.
- There is a tangible difference in level between the bachelor's and master's degrees which is reflected in the way students are taught and assessed.
- A good supervision of the master's thesis is implemented.
- A high-quality academic staff is in place, consisting in 8 specialized professors/ associate professors and 5 assistant professors, the vast majority of whom are PhD holders.

### WEAKNESSES:

- No institutional structure or body dedicated to research.
- No institutional method of monitoring masters of Law graduates: there are no official statistics concerning the professional integration of graduates or their further studies.
- Complex management structure.

### RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE INSTITUTION:

For these different reasons, the panel of experts makes the following recommendations:

- One of the aims of the master in Public Law is to prepare students and qualifying them to move to the higher educational stage, the PhD degree in Law.
- In the self-evaluation report of the master, four mains goals are listed. Among these four, two are related to research:
  - o "3- Develop legal research, and filling the gap in the field of specialized legal research, in line with the legislative and judicial development within the Qatari, regional and international community.
  - o 4- Prepare learners and qualifying them to move to the higher educational stage, the PhD degree in Law".

To achieve these objectives, the Public Law master's program is characterised by an orientation towards research, with the compulsory writing of a master's thesis. Students are prepared for research work and the writing of the master's thesis is well supervised by a referent teacher. But this is not enough. The masters' programs must also have a strong research component based on research methods, the use of documentary resources, and the promotion of collective, local or international research. Currently, there is no structure or body dedicated to research. The research activities of the faculty members exist (publication in scientific journals, organisation of conferences, visiting professors, etc.) but the effectiveness of the research dimension could be improved by the creation of a structure dedicated to research.

- The management structure is complex and not all faculty members are familiar with it. In order to make steering effective, it would therefore be beneficial either to simplify the existing structure or to provide more information about the existing structure.

- There is very good communication within the College of Law between academics and learners. This facilitated communication and the availability of the faculty members allowed for a very good management of the health crisis. But there is no institutional monitoring of graduates, i.e. a structure that sets up a process to monitor graduates at specific times, in order to assess their professional integration within a predefined framework (nature of employment, level of employment, remuneration, etc.). A more institutionalized follow-up would make it possible to ensure a good adaptation of the curriculum to the needs of the job market. This work is usually done at the university level, but the results are not precise enough for law graduates.

## VII. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION



### The Master's Program Report

As stated in Qatar University's policy, admission into the various Diploma, Masters and PhD programs is "extremely competitive." The Evaluation Report issued by HCERES supports this premise recognizing that admission to the Master of Laws (LLM) in Public Law and Private Law is "selectively targeting a population of students who are already integrated in the job market but looking for a deeper legal expertise and higher qualification." The Report rightly acknowledges that both masters "provide a high level of understanding of the fundamentals of the law; enabling students to acquire a rigorous legal method; developing critical thinking (to) enable students to specialize in particular areas of law."

The Report emphasizes the importance of research. In fact, the Report points out that in the master's programs, unlike the bachelor level, the students are "more considered like researchers rather than students." As mentioned in the Report, master's students are required to complete a compulsory thesis that addresses topics "eminently linked to the contemporary environment" and "related to recent news." This research is supervised by a faculty that the Report describes as distinguished for its "diversity, cultural richness." However, the Report concludes that this "orientation towards research is not enough." It calls for "the creation of a structure dedicated to research." Our graduate office, chaired by an Associate Dean for Research and Graduate Students and supported by a coordinator for research adequately and effectively performs this function. Our College of Law also hosts a research umbrella; namely the Center for Law and Development which is being revised and developed. So we will indeed consider the research structure that the Report is calling for establishing, "based on research methods, the use of documentary resources, and the promotion of collective, local or international research." Currently, we are publishing an annotated bibliography on legal writing on the laws of Qatar in both languages, English and Arabic. We also update our library resources on frequent basis.

Other recommendations are also worth examining in a future action plan to advance the master's programs, especially after we have successfully initiated a doctoral degree. The Report makes a special reference to the absence of an "institutional monitoring of graduates." Creating an alumni association to integrate professionals who complete their master's studies is an urgent task. Also, importantly to clearly define the specific role of the various college committees at the master's level, especially the committee for academic affairs. Linking our programs with similar academic institutions in foreign universities is beneficial not only on the bachelor's level but also in our masters programs.

To meet the recent developments in the different areas of the law and to respond to the changes in the job market, we are redesigning the syllabi of the courses that we teach and we are adding new elective courses. As recognized by the Report, "the curriculum seems sufficiently rich to allow students to acquire precise and specialized knowledge." We would like to continue progressing by adopting the international standards of the HCERES.



Dr. Talal Abdulla Al-Emadi  
Dean of College of Law  
Qatar University



تليفون: ٤٤٠٣٥٢٥٢ - ٤٤٠٣٥٢٥٤ فاكس: ٤٤٠٣٥٢٥٣ (+٩٧٤) ص. ب. ٢٧١٣ - الدوحة - قطر  
Tel.: (+974) 4403 5252 - 4403 5254 Fax: (+974) 4403 5253 P.O.Box: 2713, Doha - Qatar  
E-mail: law@qu.edu.qa Web: www.qu.edu.qa



International evaluation and accreditation

## ACCREDITATION DECISION

### Masters of Law (Public and Private Law)

College of Law

Qatar University

Qatar

**March 28<sup>th</sup> 2023**

## SCOPE OF THE ACCREDITATION GRANTED BY HCÉRES

HCÉRES has based its evaluation process on a set of objectives that higher education institution study programs must pursue to ensure recognised quality within France and Europe. These objectives are divided up into four fields among which are the accreditation criteria.

The Accreditation Commission issues an opinion about the accreditation of the program after examining the file. The Hcéres President takes the decision based on the Commission's opinion and the final evaluation report of the program. This accreditation decision, taken in plenary session, is the result of a collegial and reasoned process.

The decision issued by Hcéres regarding the accreditation of the program corresponds to the awarding of a label to the evaluated entity.

This decision is independent of the accreditations carried out by the French State and therefore does not entail recognition in France of the Institution's diplomas.

**Decision No.2023- 16 on the accreditation of the Master of Private Law delivered by Qatar University - College of Law - Qatar.**

**The President of the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education,**

Considering the Research Code, in particular Articles L. 114-3-1 to L. 114-3-6;

Considering the Decree No. 2021-1536 of November 29<sup>th</sup> 2021 on the organisation and operation of the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education;

Considering the Council's deliberation of October 3<sup>rd</sup> 2016 on the evaluation of foreign study programmes - external evaluation reference framework;

Considering the Decision No. 2023-9 of March 16<sup>th</sup> 2023 on the international accreditation procedure of the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education;

Considering the agreement No.20210309 – Qatar University with the Qatar University for the evaluation/accreditation of the Master of Private Law;

Considering the opinion issued by the Accreditation Commission of March 20<sup>th</sup> 2023,

**Decides:**

**Article 1**

Noting that the Master of Private Law delivered by Qatar University meets the four accreditation criteria, voted by the council of the High Council on October 3<sup>rd</sup> 2016, as follows:

**ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 1: AIMS OF THE STUDY PROGRAM**

The goals of the training, both in terms of knowledge and skills to be acquired and in terms of opportunities are defined and known by the students, which makes the Master of Private Law very competitive, despite a stronger attractiveness for the Master of Public Law, corresponding to the particularities of the job market in Qatar. The skills developed during the training are in line with the socio-professional world which the graduates are destined to integrate.

**ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 2: POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAM**

The Master's degree is claimed to be unique and enjoy a good reputation. The program is open to Qatari and foreign students, mainly from the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region. The Master's degree enrolls students who are almost always employed at the same time as their training, so classes are held three days a week in the late afternoon. Qatar University appears to be the only university in Qatar to offer such training. The teaching team is marked by its cultural richness, which is recognized and appreciated.

Concerning research, 6 credits out of the 33 credits of the entire Master's program are obtained by writing a thesis, which concludes the training in the second semester of the second year. The objective of the exercise is for the student to acquire the required skills in terms of writing, analysing and demonstrating a true thesis.

Since almost all students already have a professional activity in parallel with their training, the question of links with different categories of professional partners does not really arise. For the same reason, the Master's program is not really concerned by the links with foreign academic institutions, which nevertheless exist at the College level, mainly through partnership or cooperation memoranda of understanding with a few foreign academic institutions, and through the individual relationships of some members of the Faculty.

**ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 3: STUDY PROGRAM TEACHING STRUCTURE**

The Private Law program is adapted to the Master's level and the courses offered in the study plan are aligned with the specialties of Private Law. Moreover, the program allows students to acquire the high-level academic knowledge and practical skills necessary for future working life. Beyond the curriculum,

the quality of the Master's program lies in the quality of the teaching staff, their availability and their commitment.the professors.

#### ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 4: STUDY PROGRAM MANAGEMENT

The management of the Master of Private Law is handled by a complex but comprehensive committee organization. The teaching staff is very involved in the content of the courses and very concerned about the students' interest. This staff should be more involved in the management process.

The diversity of the Faculty is very beneficial to the Master of Private Law program. The quality of the Master's program is evaluated by the Quality assurance committee in accordance with the international standards of quality and ethics.

#### Article 2

The Master of Private Law delivered by the College of Law of Qatar University is fully accredited for a period of 5 years as from the present decision.

#### Article 3

The decision is accompanied by the following recommendations and comments :

The Accreditation Commission draws attention to the following points:

- The management structure is complex and not all faculty members are familiar with it. In order to make steering effective, it would therefore be beneficial either to simplify the existing structure or to provide more information about the existing structure.
- There is no institutional monitoring of graduates, i.e. a structure that sets up a process to monitor graduates at specific times, in order to assess their professional integration within a predefined framework (nature of employment, level of employment, remuneration, etc.). A more institutionalized follow-up would make it possible to ensure a good adaptation of the curriculum to the needs of the job market.
- The master's program should have a stronger research component based on research methods, the use of documentary resources, and the promotion of collective, local or international research. The research activities of the faculty members exist (publication in scientific journals, organisation of conferences, visiting professors, etc.) but the effectiveness of the research dimension could be improved by the creation of a structure dedicated to research.

#### Article 4

The Director of the Europe and International Department is responsible for the execution of this decision, which will be published on the Hcéres website.

Paris, March 28<sup>th</sup> 2023



7 rue Albert Einstein  
75013 Paris, France  
T 03 (0)1 55 55 60 10

The President



Thierry COUCHON

## **Decision No.2023-15 on the accreditation of the Master of Public Law delivered by Qatar University - College of Law - Qatar.**

### **The President of the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education,**

Considering the Research Code, in particular Articles L. 114-3-1 to L. 114-3-6;

Considering the Decree No. 2021-1536 of November 29<sup>th</sup> 2021 on the organisation and operation of the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education;

Considering the Council's deliberation of October 3<sup>rd</sup> 2016 on the evaluation of foreign study programmes - external evaluation reference framework;

Considering the Decision No. 2023-9 of March 16<sup>th</sup> 2023 on the international accreditation procedure of the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education;

Considering the agreement No.20210309 – Qatar University with the Qatar University for the evaluation/accreditation of the Master of Public Law;

Considering the opinion issued by the Accreditation Commission of March 20<sup>th</sup> 2023,

### **Decides:**

#### **Article 1**

Noting that the Master of Public Law delivered by Qatar University meets the four accreditation criteria, voted by the council of the High Council on October 3<sup>rd</sup> 2016, as follows:

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 1: AIMS OF THE STUDY PROGRAM**

The goals of the training, both in terms of knowledge and skills to be acquired and in terms of opportunities, are well defined and known by the students, which makes the Master of Public Law very competitive, in accordance with the particularities of the job market in Qatar whose public sector needs more lawyers. The skills developed during the training are in line with the socio-professional world where most of the graduates are already integrated.

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 2: POSITION OF THE STUDY PROGRAM**

Qatar University appears to be the only university in Qatar to offer such training. The Public Law Master's degree is claimed to be unique and enjoy a good reputation in the country and in the North Africa (MENA) region. The faculty is marked by its cultural richness, which is a recognized and appreciated asset. Considering that the program enrolls students who are almost always employed at the same time as their training, mostly in public organizations, classes are offered three days a week in the late afternoon.

Concerning research, writing a thesis is mandatory and represents 6 credits out of the 33 credits of the study plan, concluding the second semester of the second year. The objective of the exercise is for the student to acquire the required skills in terms of writing, analysing and demonstrating a true thesis.

Concerning partnerships, the question of links with different categories of professional partners is not quite relevant since almost all students are already employed. For the same reason, the Master's program is not really concerned by the links with foreign academic institutions, which nevertheless exist at the College level, mainly through partnership or cooperation memoranda of understanding with a few foreign academic institutions, and through the individual relationships of some members of the Faculty.

#### **ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 3: STUDY PROGRAM TEACHING STRUCTURE**

The Master's program is adapted to this level of graduate studies and the comprehensive study plan is aligned with the specialties of Public Law. Moreover, the students are provided with high-level academic knowledge and practical skills necessary for their specialization. Beyond the curriculum, the

Master's program also benefits from the quality of the faculty, the availability and the commitment of the professors.

#### ACCREDITATION CRITERIA 4: STUDY PROGRAM MANAGEMENT

The Master of Public Law is managed by a complex but comprehensive committee organization. The faculty is very involved in the content of the courses and very concerned about the students' interest but could be more involved in the management process.

The diversity of the Faculty is clearly an asset for the Master of Public Law program. The quality of the Master's program is evaluated by the Quality assurance committee in accordance with the international standards of quality and ethics.

#### Article 2

The Master of Public Law delivered by the College of Law of Qatar University is fully accredited for a period of 5 years as from the present decision.

#### Article 3

The decision is accompanied by the following recommendations and comments :

The Accreditation Commission draws attention to the following points:

- The management structure is complex and not all faculty members are familiar with it. In order to make steering effective, it would therefore be beneficial either to simplify the existing structure or to provide more information about the existing structure.
- There is no institutional monitoring of graduates, i.e. a structure that sets up a process to monitor graduates at specific times, in order to assess their professional integration within a predefined framework (nature of employment, level of employment, remuneration, etc.). A more institutionalized follow-up would make it possible to ensure a good adaptation of the curriculum to the needs of the job market.
- The master's program should have a stronger research component based on research methods, the use of documentary resources, and the promotion of collective, local or international research. The research activities of the faculty members exist (publication in scientific journals, organisation of conferences, visiting professors, etc.) but the effectiveness of the research dimension could be improved by the creation of a structure dedicated to research.

#### Article 4

The Director of the Europe and International Department is responsible for the execution of this decision, which will be published on the Hcéres website.

Paris, March 28<sup>th</sup> 2023



2 rue Albert Einstein  
75013 Paris, France  
T. 33 (0)1 55 55 60 10

The President



Thierry COULHON



2 rue Albert Einstein  
75013 Paris, France  
T. 33 (0)1 55 55 60 10

[hceres.fr](http://hceres.fr)

[@Hceres\\_](https://twitter.com/Hceres_)

[Hcéres](https://www.youtube.com/Hceres)