



International evaluation and accreditation

EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION DOCUMENTS

PhD Agricultural Economics (Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics)

Centre for Dryland Agriculture
Bayero University, Kano

Nigeria

December 2021

Rapport publié le 07/01/2022

CONTENTS

| | |
|-----------------------------|----------------|
| Evaluation report | pages 2 to 13 |
| Comments of the institution | pages 14 to 15 |
| Accreditation decision | pages 16 to 20 |



International evaluation and accreditation

EVALUATION REPORT

PhD Agricultural Economics (Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics)

Centre for Dryland Agriculture
Bayero University, Kano

Nigeria

September 2021

Bayero University, Kano has mandated Hcéres to perform its Agricultural Economics (Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics) doctoral program evaluation. The evaluation is based on the “External Evaluation Standards for doctorates out of France”, adopted by the Hcéres Board on March 26, 2018. These standards are available on the Hcéres website (hceres.fr).

On account of exceptional circumstances, the organization of the evaluation was adapted (replacement of the physical on-site visit by the panel by a visit by videoconference), while remaining compliant with the fundamental principles of institution or study program evaluation: external evaluation standard applied, the self-evaluation report (SER) and requested annexes sent by the institution, panel of experts set up by the Hcéres, collegial work by the panel, interviews with the institution and its partners by videoconference, report drafted and then sent to the institution in its provisional and then final version, response by the institution to the report by the panel. This specific procedure is in line with the official position defined jointly by the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) and the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR).

For the Hcéres¹ :

Thierry Coulhon, President

On behalf of the experts committee² :

Carole Molina Jouve, President of the committee

In accordance with the decree n°2014-1365, November 14th, 2014,

¹The president of Hcéres “countersigns the assessment reports made by the experts’ committees and signed by their president” (article 8, alinéa 5).

²The evaluation reports “are signed by the president of the committee” (article 11, alinea 2).

I. NATIONAL CONTEXT AND INSTITUTION IDENTITY SHEET

GENERAL CONTEXT AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Bayero University, Kano (BUK), established by the Federal Government of Nigeria in 1979 (Decree No. 79), is one of the Universities in Nigeria that provides high quality training in diverse areas. Located in Kano, capital city of Kano State in North West zone of Nigeria, BUK has 2 colleges, a business school, 18 faculties and 97 departments. BUK presently manages 85 undergraduate degree programmes, and 122 postgraduate programmes including 25 postgraduate diplomas, 59 masters and 38 doctorates. Additionally, there are 11 centres and Institutes, plus several other supporting units. Actually, the student population is around 48,010 with 37,626 undergraduate and 10,384 postgraduate students, and the number of staff is around 1,784 teaching staff. The mission of BUK is to provide world-class academic and professional training, community services and research for the advancement of society.

One of academic centres of BUK is the centre for dryland agriculture (CDA). This centre was established in 2011 by the University Senate to respond to the development needs of the West and Central African (WCA) dryland region by contributing to improve agricultural productivity and sustainable management of the environmental resources through relevant high-level human capacity development, demand-driven research and effective outreach. The centre becomes in 2014 an African center of excellence (ACE) in dryland agriculture. The main objective of the establishment of the CDA is to specialize as a regional centre of excellence in dryland agriculture delivering quality training and applied research in response to the needs of the WCA region, thus contributing to food security, improved livelihood and reduction in poverty and conflicts. The centre offers postgraduate programmes awarding MSc and PhD in agronomy (with specialization in crops and cropping systems in the drylands), geography (natural resource economics and climate change), animal science (with specialization in livestock production and range management in drylands), agricultural economics (with specialization in livelihoods and natural resource economics), and agricultural technology in 5 academic departments: agronomy, geography, agricultural economics and extension, animal science, agricultural and environmental engineering. The CDA also manages a postgraduate diploma programme (PGD) in dryland agriculture and organises several short courses for the specific training needs of stakeholders.

INSTITUTION

1. **University/institution:** Bayero University, Kano (BUK).
2. **Component, faculty or department concerned:** Centre for dryland agriculture (CDA), department of agricultural economics and extension, faculty of agriculture.
3. **Programme's title:** PhD agricultural economics.
4. **Training/specialty:** Livelihood and natural resource economics (LNE).
5. **Year of creation and context:** Established in 2012 as an on-site full time programme of the centre for dryland agriculture (CDA) in BUK to respond to the needs of the West and Central Africa (WCA) dryland region through relevant high-level human capacity development and demand-driven research.
6. **Site(s) where the programme is taught (Town and campus):** Kano, Bayero University main campus, centre for dryland agriculture (CDA).
7. **Programme director:**
 - a) Surname, first name: Abdullahi Ali
 - b) Profession and grade: Senior lecturer, PhD
 - c) Main subject taught: Agricultural extension

METHODS AND RESULTS OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION(S)

8. Methodology and agency:

The accreditation of the PhD programme in agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) was conducted by the National Universities Commission (NUC) of Nigeria in March 2017.

9. Results:

This programme, which achieved 92.6% overall in the NUC accreditation exercise, is accredited for a period of 5 years.

HUMAN AND MATERIAL RESOURCES DEDICATED TO THE PROGRAMME

10. Human resources:

The staff is composed of 15 academic staff in permanent position (including 9 professors, 2 associate professors and 4 senior lecturers), 6 senior technical staff and 2 junior staff.

11. Material resources:

The PhD programme agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) benefits from the CDA and BUK facilities. 13 offices are made available for academic staff, and students have access to:

- Classrooms of the University, shared among departments, and 4 CDA classrooms fully air-conditioned and equipped with projectors and electronic smartboards;
- Central library and internet facilities in the CDA office complex, and lecture rooms;
- 31 offices;
- Research units of the centre (GIS laboratory, molecular laboratory, central instrumentation laboratory and tissue culture laboratory), with specific equipment for PhD student;
- Network of automated weather stations, a field camp support and cloud based air quality device;
- 22 hectares training and research farm, well equipped with drip and sprinkler irrigation facilities with full automation, net houses, screen houses, and a greenhouse, field research equipment including green seekers, GPS units, android Phones.

Photographs of lecture rooms, laboratories and the farm, showing equipment and staff involved in trainings and research, were presented to the committee. These photographs allow to assess the quality of the accommodation, material resources, teaching and training conditions.

CDA students have access to campus-wide license for numerous software. Free internet connection is available for all faculty members and students. They use emails, newsletters, websites and other electronic media for communication and social media platforms. All information on professional training events, scholarship opportunities, conferences and research activities are hosted on the CDA website. Experts could not verify this information as the website did not work. In addition, numerous e-resources are available for students, including databases such as ScienceDirect, Scopus, EBSCOHOST, LAN TEEAL and AGORA.

STUDENT POPULATION: EVOLUTION AND TYPOLOGY OVER THE LAST 4 YEARS

| Year | Female (National) | Male (National) | Female (Foreign) | Male (Foreign) | TOTAL enrolled | Applicants | Graduates |
|--------------|-------------------|-----------------|------------------|----------------|----------------|------------|-----------|
| 2015/2016 | 2 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 8 | 2 |
| 2016/2017 | 2 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 9 | 0 |
| 2017/2018 | 2 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 16 | 0 |
| 2018/2019 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 10 | 0 |
| 2019/2020 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 25 | 0 |
| TOTAL | 6 | 13 | 1 | 1 | 21 | 68 | 2 |

II. EVALUATION PROCEDURE

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE

President:

- Carole Molina Jouve, Professor, Institut National des Sciences appliquées de Toulouse

Experts:

- Christophe Bressac, Assistant Professor, Université de Tours
- Delphine Latour, Assistant Professor, Université de Clermont-Auvergne
- Mathilde Colas, PhD student (Student expert), Université de Technologie de Troyes

The committee was accompanied by Prof. Pierre Courtellemont, science advisor at the Hcéres, and Antoine Devoucoux du Buysson, head of project at the Hcéres.

ON-SITE VISIT DESCRIPTION

- Date of the visit: January 12th and 13th, 2021.
- Organisation of the visit: the virtual visit (due to COVID-19 sanitary crisis) took place over 2 days from January 12th and 13th. The first day started with a welcome speech by the Vice-chancellor and a discussion with the management team in charge of the self-assessment CDA's training programmes auditioned: PhD natural resource management and climate change, PhD agronomy (crops and cropping systems in dryland), MSc & PhD agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) and MSc & PhD animal science (livestock production and range management in African drylands). Others meetings followed with each team leaders of these training programmes (in the order listed above) and then academic staff from all training programmes. The second day started with closed meeting with students, followed with alumni and partners and finally a wrap-up meeting with head and leaders in charge of all programmes.
- Cooperation of study programme and institution to be accredited: perfect cooperation by all stakeholders
- People met:
 - Vice chancellor and management team
 - The Vice chancellor - Professor Sagir Adamu Abbas
 - Director, Academic Planning - Professor Haruna Musa
 - Director, CDA - Professor Jibrin M. Jibrin
 - Deputy Director Training - Professor Sanusi Gaya Mohammed
 - Deputy Director Outreach and Publications - Professor Amina Mustapha
 - Deputy Director Research - Dr Kabir Mustapha Umar
 - Project manager - Dr Yusuf Garba
 - Coordinator Training - Dr Murtala Muhammad Badamasi
 - Coordinator Outreach - Dr Amina Lawan Mustapha
 - Student Liaison officer - Dr Aminu Alhassan Fagge

Team leaders in charge of MSc & PhD degrees agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics)

Dr Ali Abdullahi
 Professor Aminu Suleiman
 Dr Ibrahim Tafida
 Professor Ahmed Bakori Mohammed
 Professor Abba Aminu
 Professor Ahmad Muhammad Makarfi
 Dr Amina Aminu Idris
 Dr Muhammad Sabiu Suleiman
 Professor Amina Mustapha
 Professor Mahmud Ibrahim Daneji

Other teachers and scientists from MSc & PhD agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics), MSc & PhD animal science (livestock production and range management in African drylands), PhD agronomy (crops and cropping systems in dryland) and PhD natural resource management and climate change

Kabir Mustapha Umar

Saleh B. Momale

Bashir Musa

Suleiman Rufai Babura

Lawal Abdul Sani

Dr Alpha Y. Kamara

Dr Hakeem Ayinde Ajeigbe

Dr Foloronso Akinseye

Professor J.M. Jibrin

Professor S.G. Mohammed

Students and alumni from 2 MSc & 4 PhD degrees

20 students, 8 alumni

Industrial Partners from 2 MSc & 4 PhD degrees

ICRISAT - Dr H.A. Ajeigbe

IITA - Dr A.Y. Kamara

Sassakawa Africa Association/SG2000 – Professor Sani Miko

NEWMAP – Musa Shuaibu

- Any problems: None
- Other: None

III. PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

1 – PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

The study programme of the PhD agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) was established in 2012 as an on-site full-time programme of three years. This programme is run by the department of agricultural economics and extension (faculty of agriculture), coordinated by the centre for dryland agriculture (CDA), in Bayero University, Kano (BUK).

The main objective is to provide the training needed for the improvement of the human conditions and produce highly specialized professionals with an advanced knowledge of the fundamentals of agricultural economics and agricultural extension. The target audience is composed of students with a master degree in agricultural economics or related discipline.

This doctorate includes course work, internship, seminar and research phase. The course work corresponds to 3 common courses of 3 credits each. Internship and seminars are not credited but obligatory. The PhD programme, designed as full time only, has a minimum duration of 6 semesters and a maximum duration of 10 semesters. The part-time programme shall run for a minimum duration of 6 semesters and maximum of 14 semesters. Expected carriers are academic research, economic advisor, research consultant, marketing or business consultant.

2 – PRESENTATION OF THE PROGRAMME'S SELF-EVALUATION APPROACH

The CDA is evaluating its PhD agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) programme with the aim of getting it internationally accredited. This evaluation is based on a dual process: self-evaluation and external evaluation (Hcéres). To conduct the self-evaluation, an internal committee was constituted by the Director of the CDA, Professor Jibrin Mohammed Jibrin, and the external evaluation has been carried out by the Hcéres. The members of the internal committee are:

- Associate Professor Yusuf Garba, project manager – ACE project and chairman of the committee
- Dr Aminu Alhassan Fagge, student welfare officer – ACE management team
- Dr Amina Lawan Mustapha, outreach coordinator – ACE management team
- Dr Mustapha Mohammed Bello
- Associate Professor Murtala Muhammad Badamasi, coordinator training – ACE management team and secretary of the committee

In carrying out the assignment, the committee worked closely with senior lecturer Ali Abdullahi, head of department of agricultural economics and extension. The self-assessment methodology was based on the Hcéres training evaluation reference system.

IV. EVALUATION REPORT

AREA 1 – THE POSITIONING OF THE DOCTORATE

The PhD livelihood and natural resource economics focuses on agricultural economics and agricultural extension for sustainable management of dryland environment. The objective of the doctorate is clear, the programme content and duration are well defined, in accordance with the World Bank objectives. Its target audience is clearly identified and composed of students with a Master degree in agricultural economics or related discipline. The centre for dryland agriculture (CDA) has the administrative management of this training, which ensures proper functioning.

The internship of one month is a good way to ensure the link between students and the job market. Numerous socio-economic partners are mentioned in the building of this training, which facilitates student integration in the job market. Nevertheless, no abroad internship is carried out and only two foreign students are registered in this training. The international dynamic should be reinforced by an effective mobility programme.

Area 1-1: The doctorate's distinct features and objectives are clearly defined

The PhD livelihood and natural resource economics combines course work with a dissertation; it is adapted to the needs of students for master's programme in dryland agriculture and with specialization in livelihood and natural resource economics or related discipline. All admission requirements are detailed on the BUK website and the student handbook.

The goal of this programme is to train professionals with an advanced knowledge of livelihood and natural resource economics for sustainable management of dryland environment. One major objective is to provide a high quality training and applied research in response of the needs of the West and Central African region. This is only possible with the full support of Bayero University, Kano and more specifically of the CDA.

Area 1-2: The positioning of the doctorate is consistent with its environment

This training is coordinated by the CDA, which serves as a technical and research unit for students; it is housed in the department of agricultural economics and extension, which runs the day-to-day activities. Monthly meetings are organized to well monitor this doctorate.

The CDA helps to improve the capacity of the whole university in modern pedagogy. For instance, staff has been trained twice of the use of modern pedagogical tools. Nevertheless, this dynamic must be continued as these tools are not yet successfully used by teachers.

The research units are well involved in the training and contribute to all phases, from the recruitment to the teaching and the supervision of internships.

The interaction with the socio-economic environment is ensured by numerous partners involved in the building of this doctorate. An internship of one month (minimum) allows students to be introduced in the real world settings and encourages them to better address their research to industrial demands. Nevertheless, the international dynamic is not well promoted and a real mobility programme should be proposed, as the centre exposed. Despite international partners mentioned (Kansas State University, USA ; Jain Irrigation Systems Limited, India ; International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics, Mali ; CIRAD, Mali), only two international students have been enrolled during the last five years in this training, and none has done an internship abroad. So, the international partnership is not active enough to promote the expected influence of this training.

AREA 2 – ORGANISATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE DOCTORATE

The doctorate's organizational structure is managed by the CDA and based on a scientific teaching, technical and administrative team that successfully manages and coordinates it. The roles and responsibilities of each team member are clearly defined.

The admission level, requirements, application and registration processes, work progress monitoring and evaluation are well defined in the student handbook. Nevertheless, the CDA website needs to be deeply improved and updated in order to promote this training.

Even if the two categories of grants are well mentioned, only few students benefit of financial support (4 students with grant) and most of them are self-sponsored. Moreover, the grant amount is generally not enough, and alternative solutions may be found to support registration fees, food and accommodation for Nigerian support.

PhD student funding is not sufficient to ensure a right progress of their research work as most of them are self-sponsored. Other sources of funding must be found to ensure the future of this training.

Area 2-1: Effective organization and management is in place for the doctorate

The effective organization and management of the doctorate are mainly supported by teachers and administrative staff belonging to the CDA. The centre has several boards (International scientific advisor board, sectoral/industry advisory board, academic board) to coordinate successfully this doctorate.

The CDA management team (Director, deputy centre leader, programme coordinators, project manager, industry liaison officer, monitoring and evaluation officer and student representative) is in charge of the day-to-day running.

The student handbook is well detailed and it describes all rules and requirements of this training as duration, credit units requirements, application procedure, eligibility and admission processes.

The department of agriculture economics and extension provides adequate human resources: 15 permanent teaching staff and 6 technicians for training, plus 2 junior staff. Also, 4 well equipped classrooms are dedicated to the programme and students have access to all of the centre laboratories which provide the necessary tools to carry out their work.

Classic internal communication tools are used as emails to communicate with students. The CDA website is also available even if it needs to be deeply improved in particular to be used as external communication tool.

The evaluation of this doctorate is mainly conducted by the CDA with online survey. Moreover, at the end of each semester, the directorate of academic planning coordinates lecturer evaluation by students. Nevertheless, no formal feedback or conclusion is communicated.

Area 2-2: There is an explicit policy for recruiting and funding doctoral students, which is adapted to the PhD program

To be eligible into the programme, candidates must have an MSc degree in agricultural economics or related discipline with minimum cumulative grade point average out of 3. The rules of recruitment are well exposed in the student handbook.

The selection and eligibility to grants are well exposed in the scholarship policy document. Two categories of scholarship are provided by the CDA: (i) study fellowship award, applicable to the regional students who come from other African countries, and covers tuition fees, accommodation and a monthly stipend; (ii) student research grant, applicable to all students but covering only approved research expenditure. As these grants are shared between all the CDA trainings, the number of grants can therefore fluctuate from year to year and the staff regrets a low number of fellowships. Indeed, during the last five years, only one PhD student had a CDA grant, which is really surprising and certainly not enough to ensure the future of this training. Other funding resources exist, as from Federal University (1 grant) and ACE fellowship (2 grants) but are not well explored. In most cases (i.e. 80% of students), PhD students are self-sponsored, which is not acceptable. Moreover, for the few who have a scholarship, the amount is not enough and students need support of their families or have to work in private companies in addition. That probably partly explains the additional delay observed for PhD defense.

Doctoral students have the appropriate conditions for preparing their doctorate. Indeed, each doctoral student has two supervisors, one academic belonging to the CDA and one from the host company. In addition, the low number of student enrolled in this programme allows a good access to scientific equipment and all facilities of the CDA available for doctoral students.

AREA 3 – SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS

Supervising and follow-up of doctorate are precisely defined in the postgraduate student handbook. This includes regular progress reports and seminars given by students. The internship of at least one month is a good way to prepare students to their employment.

Diverse teaching courses are offered to students but with no choice of specialized courses, which can be improved. Validation methods and content of these courses are well explained in the postgraduate student handbook.

The thesis duration and the criteria for authorizing thesis defense are explicit and clearly communicated to doctoral students and supervisors. Nevertheless, the thesis duration is too long and the supervision of students needs to be closer and more efficient.

Area 3-1: The doctorate applies a strict doctoral student supervision and follow-up policy

In most cases, two PhD supervisors are recommended: one from CDA and one from the company which collaborates with the doctorate. A PhD supervisor shall be holder of the PhD degree of at least three years and at least of the rank of senior lecturer, or if not a holder PhD, he must be a professor. All detailed rules concerning the responsibilities of the student, the change of supervisor or suspension of period of registration are given in the postgraduate student handbook.

A supervisor shall keep records of the candidate's progress and submit regular progress reports to the board of the school of postgraduate studies. In addition, the seminar presentations of doctorates also allow a good monitoring of student's research activities.

Preparation for employment begins with the workplace experience during the internship. This is reinforced by courses in entrepreneurship, leadership and organizational management proposed to students during their PhD. The university has a code of ethics where anti-fraud, relationship with staff, conduct on the campus are recorded.

Area 3-2: The doctorate offers diverse teaching and organizes supplementary events

Courses are linked to the expertise of teachers and research units belonging to the CDA. The students participate in non-credit skills development courses and seminars. Students that did not go through the MSc Agricultural Economics and Extension (Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics) programme audit relevant MSc courses

Methods for validating this teaching are well set out in the postgraduate student handbook when the students can find the outcomes of assessment and the score assigned.

Area 3-3: The doctorate is based on explicit rules for thesis duration and defense

The duration of PhD is clear and shall run for a minimum duration of three years and maximum of five in full-time. In case of part-time PhD students, the maximum duration is extended to seven years. As most of students are self-sponsored since 2015 (available data), they are probably considered in part-time, explaining that only two (among 6 registered in 2015) has been graduated; that is not enough to promote a serious standing of this training. The student supervision needs to be closer and more efficient.

To be eligible for the award of this training, a candidate is required to obtain 6 credits of 2 courses from PhD course work, 12 credits from thesis, a one-month non-credit internship and non-credit seminars. In the postgraduate student handbook, there is no mention of the requirement of a scientific publication for the defense even if supervisors have explained during the virtual visit, that it is an important point. So, in order to level up this training, it could be useful to formally require a scientific publication for the PhD defense, and also to encourage participation in national and international congresses.

AREA 4 – INTEGRATION OF DOCTORS INTO THE JOB MARKET

Partnerships established with numerous partners at local, regional and international level, participate to promote the doctorate. Nevertheless, the low number of current graduates does not allow to really assess the integration into the job market. So, even if this training is recent, the management team must pay attention to the delay of thesis. In addition, the lack of new PhD students during these last two years requests also a particular vigilance. To enhance the promotion of this PhD, more formal tools could be used to better monitor the integration of doctorates into the job market, and the CDA website should be updated.

Area 4-1: The doctorate includes mechanisms to promote the integration of doctors into the job market

The centre has numerous socio-economical partners, which help to promote the integration of doctors into the job market. Nevertheless, with only two graduated PhD student these last five years, their real integration into the job market is not yet visible. Alumni would participate to promote this programme, but, again, the low number of current graduates cannot be enough to ensure the best promotion.

There is no formal tools to inform about the requirements and conditions of potential job openings as the centre's website is not well updated. Nevertheless, the close relationship with partners and their professional networks ensures the good dissemination of information.

Area 4-2: The doctorate has effective monitoring of the integration of doctors into the job market

Despite the low number of students, the track of graduates is not formally structured. Moreover, alumni are not yet organized in association but kept in touch with the staff and students.

As only two student have been graduated these last five years, it is difficult to have a real view of employment. One of them who received a CDA scholarship got a job at Bayero University, Kano. Other employments are mentioned in the academic way or government agencies, concerning however not yet graduated students.

Area 4-3: The data collected is analyzed, communicated and used

The few data collected about employment were used in guiding the development of programme curriculum. 21 PhD students were enrolled since 2015 and only 2 PhD students were graduated, which testified of too long duration of the thesis. Moreover, most students are Nigerian (only 2 international students) and an increase of the international visibility is recommended. It can start with an efficient and more functional website.

Even if the number of applicants has doubled during the last three years (8-9 applicants from 2015 to 2016 and 16-25 from 2017 to 2020), the number of enrolled students decreased since 2018 (2 enrolled students in 2018 and 0 in 2019), so independently of Covid crisis. No explanation is provided concerning this lack of enrolment and this is a worrying point for the future of this training.

The data communication to local, national and international partners (institutions and socio-economic partners) should be a key factor to increase attractiveness and benefits to meet African challenges.

V. CONCLUSION

The PhD programme in agricultural economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) is unique in the region and is clearly identified as well as its target audience. The centre for Dryland Agriculture (CDA) has the administrative management of this training which ensures proper functioning. This centre provides also all facilities and an efficient teaching team to well supervise PhD students.

The number of students enrolled in this doctorate is correct, except the last two years despite a high number of applicants. Even if the Covid crisis could explain the lack of recruitment in 2019-2020, it cannot explain the low enrolment of 2018. Moreover, only two foreign student are registered in this training. The international dynamics should be reinforced by an effective mobility programme.

The link between students and job market is particularly ensured by the internship. Nevertheless, the too low number of graduated students does not allow to attest of its efficiency.

Even if all tools to follow students are well exposed (regular progress reports and seminars given by students), the duration of the thesis exceeds the expected time of three years. This is partly explained by the fact that most of students are self-sponsored. Indeed, very few students obtained a scholarship; it is a real difficulty for this doctorate, both in terms of attractiveness and integration into the job market. This main difficulty was not pointed out by the management team during the visit or in the self-evaluation report but emerges with the analysis of the additional data requested. In order to maintain this doctorate in the future, a better strategy of funding must be proposed. The global dynamic of this training during these last five years is worrying and one can wonder about the sustainability of this training in the future.

TODAY'S CHALLENGES

- Do everything to allow students to graduate on time and finish their thesis in the expected three years
- Improve recruitment and promote employment of graduate students
- Improve communication and CDA website
- Reinforce the valorization of the scientific results of the doctoral students by international publications and national/international congresses participation

OUTLOOK OF THE FUTURE

- Increase the number of students and extend the student recruitment to regional countries, with gender balance
- Increase the number of scholarships
- Increase visibility and attractiveness of the doctorate

STRENGTHS

- Unique training in Nigeria focusing in livelihood and agricultural economics in dryland systems
- Well-structured training programme, with an adequate number of qualified staff
- Facilities of high level supported by the CDA

WEAKNESSES

- Lack of enrolled students due to a lack of attractiveness
- Lack of scholarships to support students
- Duration of thesis exceeding the three expected years

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Improve the external communication, especially update the CDA website, to promote this training and increase the number of students
- Improve and diversify the sources of funding
- Encourage closer supervision of students to reduce the duration of thesis and allow better integration into the job market
- Encourage incoming and outgoing international mobility of students

VI. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION



CENTRE FOR DRYLAND AGRICULTURE
BAYERO UNIVERSITY, KANO



Vice-Chancellor: Professor Sagir Adamu Abbas, B.Sc., M.Ed. (BUK), PhD (BUK), FMAN
Director: Professor Jibrin M. Jibrin, B.Agric., M.Sc., Ph.D (ABU), RSS, FSSSN

P.M.B. 3011, KANO
Tel: +234 8062720871
Email: cda@buk.edu.ng
Web: www.cda-buk.edu.ng

29th October 2021

Antoine DEVOUCOUX du BUYSSON
Responsable de projet / Head of project
Département Europe et International
Europe & International Department
2 rue Albert Einstein - 75013 Paris


Dear Professor du BUYSSON,

Re: CDA ACE Evaluation Report (PhD Agricultural Economics – Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics)

Thank you very much for sharing the evaluation report of our PhD programme in Agricultural Economics (Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics). The Centre for Dryland Agriculture (CDA) responds to the comments and recommendations contained in the report as follows:

1. *Improve the external communication, especially update the CDA website, to promote this training and increase the number of students.* The CDA accepts this recommendation. The Centre will embark on more rigorous advertisement of the programme locally and regionally. Deliberate effort will be made to strive for gender balance through provision of more incentives that will encourage more students, especially females, to apply and enroll into the programme. The Centre has already started work on improving its website (<http://cda-buk.edu.ng/programmes/>). A communications team has now been constituted with a dedicated content manager for the site.
2. *Improve and diversify the sources of funding.* The CDA accepts this recommendation. The Centre will increase its drive to seek grants that will give more opportunities to support students. Already, the Centre has recently won six research grants from the Tertiary Education Trust Fund (TETFUND) and two grants from PASET that will provide opportunities to support students.
3. *Encourage closer supervision of students to reduce the duration of thesis and allow better integration into the job market.* The CDA accepts this recommendation. Already the Centre is consulting with School of Postgraduate Studies (SPS) to institute a more rigorous process for tracking and monitoring student-supervisor progress. More effort will be done to promote the programme in the job market and to match graduates with opportunities.
4. *Encourage incoming and outgoing international mobility of students.* The CDA accepts this recommendation; effort will be made encourage inward and outward international mobility of both students and staff.

Yours sincerely



Professor Jibrin M. Jibrin

LIST OF ACRONYMS

| | |
|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ACE : | African center of excellence |
| BUK : | Bayero University, Kano |
| CDA : | Centre for dryland agriculture |
| CIRAD : | Centre de coopération internationale en recherche agronomique pour le développement |
| GIS : | Geographic information system |
| Hcéres : | High Council for the evaluation of research and higher education |
| LNE : | Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics |
| MSc : | Master of Science |
| NUC : | National Universities Commisision of Nigeria |
| PhD : | Doctoral degree |
| WCA : | West and Central Africa |
| ICRISAT : | International crops research institute for the semi-arid tropics |
| IITA : | International institute of tropical agriculture |
| ISAB : | International scientific advisory board |
| PGD : | Postgraduate diploma programme |
| SIAB : | Sectoral/industry advisory board |
| UK : | United Kingdom |
| USA : | United States of America |

Europe and International department

ACCREDITATION DECISION

Ph.D. Agricultural Economics (Livelihood and Natural Resource Economics)

Centre for Dryland Agriculture,
Bayero University, Kano

Nigeria

December 2021

SCOPE OF THE ACCREDITATION GRANTED BY HCÉRES

Hcéres has built its evaluation process based on a set of objectives that higher education institution PhD programmes must pursue to ensure recognised quality within France and Europe. These objectives are divided up into four fields among which are the accreditation criteria.

As for the "External Evaluation Standards", the accreditation criteria have been specifically designed for foreign PhD programmes. The accreditation criteria were adopted by the Board on December 2017 and are available on the Hcéres website (hceres.fr).

The accreditation committee, meeting his accreditation decision, has wholly taken into account the final evaluation report of the PhD programme. This accreditation decision is the result of a collegial and reasoned process.

The accreditation decision issued by Hcéres shall not grant any rights whatsoever, whether in France or abroad. The decision on PhD programme accreditation confers an accreditation label and does not infer recognition of the accredited qualifications. The Hcéres accreditation process therefore has no impact on the qualifications recognition process in France.

FULFILLMENT OF THE ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

AREA 1: THE POSITIONING OF THE DOCTORATE

Accreditation criterion

The positioning, the content and the objectives of the doctorate are clearly defined. Its interactions with the stakeholders (lead institution(s), foreign partners, socio-economic environment) are formally set out and effective. Its links with the research units and the institution's scientific policy are effective.

Criterion assessment

The PhD Agricultural Economics (livelihood and natural resource economics) focuses on agricultural economics and agricultural extension for sustainable management of dryland environment. The objective of the doctorate is clear, the programme content and duration are well defined, in accordance with the World Bank objectives. Its target audience is clearly identified and composed of students with a Master degree in agricultural economics or related discipline. The centre for dryland agriculture (CDA) has the administrative management of this training, which ensures proper functioning.

The internship of one month is a good way to ensure the link between students and the job market. Numerous socio-economic partners are mentioned in the building of this training, which facilitates student integration in the job market. Nevertheless, no abroad internship is carried out and only two foreign students are registered in this training. The international dynamic should be reinforced by an effective mobility programme.

AREA 2: ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE DOCTORATE

Accreditation criterion

The doctorate's organization and management are clearly defined and rely on material and human resources adapted to the requirements of programmes at ISCED level 8. Internal quality assurance mechanisms are in place and effectively used in order to improve continuously the doctorate. The doctoral students recruiting is formally set out, their funding is fair and sustainable.

Criterion assessment

The doctorate's organizational structure is managed by the CDA and based on a scientific teaching, technical and administrative team that successfully manages and coordinates it. The roles and responsibilities of each team member are clearly defined.

The admission level, requirements, application and registration processes, work progress monitoring and evaluation are well defined in the student handbook. Nevertheless, the CDA website needs to be deeply improved and updated in order to promote this training.

Even if the two categories of grants are well mentioned, only few students benefit of financial support (4 students with grant) and most of them are self-sponsored. Moreover, the grant amount is generally not enough, and alternative solutions may be found to support registration fees, food and accommodation for Nigerian students support.

AREA 3: SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS

Accreditation criterion

A strict policy of supervising and follow-up of doctoral students is set. Doctoral students have access to various teaching and professional trainings and take part in scientific/professional actions. Explicit rules are defined concerning the thesis

duration and defense. Measures to combat fraud, plagiarism and corruption are applied within the doctorate.

Criterion assessment

Supervising and follow-up of the doctorate are precisely defined in the postgraduate student handbook. This includes regular progress reports and seminars given by students. The internship of at least one month is a good way to prepare students to their employment. Diverse teaching courses are offered to students but with no choice of specialized courses, which can be improved. Validation methods and content of these courses are well explained in the postgraduate student handbook. The thesis duration and the criteria for authorizing thesis defense are explicit and clearly communicated to doctoral students and supervisors. Nevertheless, the thesis duration is too long and the supervision of students needs to be closer and more efficient.

AREA 4: INTEGRATION OF DOCTORS INTO THE JOB MARKET

Accreditation criterion

The doctorate implements systems to promote the doctorate and the integration of doctors into the job market. The integration monitoring and analysis are effective and used to perform the continuous improvement of the doctorate.

Criterion assessment

Partnerships established with numerous partners at local, regional and international level, participate to promote the doctorate. Nevertheless, the low number of current graduates does not allow to really assess the integration into the job market. So, even if this training is recent, the management team must pay attention to the delay of thesis. In addition, the lack of new PhD students during these last two years also requests a particular vigilance. To enhance the promotion of this PhD, more formal tools could be used to better monitor the integration of doctorates into the job market and the CDA website should be updated.

FINAL ASSESSMENT

Considering the accreditation criteria analysis detailed above, the accreditation committee issues the following decision:

**“Accredited with conditions for three years
(December 2021 – December 2024) with report and follow-up visit”**

and draws attention to the various recommendations made by the committee of experts in its evaluation report:

- Improve the external communication, especially update the CDA website, to promote this training and increase the number of students
- Improve and diversify the sources of funding
- Encourage closer supervision of students to reduce the duration of thesis and allow better integration into the job market
- Encourage incoming and outgoing international mobility of students

SIGNATURE

For HCERES,

Thierry Coulhon, President:



Date: Paris, December 17th 2021



2 rue Albert Einstein
75013 Paris, France
T. 33 (0)1 55 55 60 10

hceres.com

[@Hceres_](https://twitter.com/Hceres_)

[Hcéres](https://www.youtube.com/Hceres)